

China

Improvement Plan

Thematic window: Culture & Development

**Programme Title: China Culture & Development Partnership
Framework (CDPF)**

CDPF Management Response to Mid-Term Evaluation Recommendations

Evaluation Recommendation No. 1: Education

The project should accelerate and deepen its research on what has been done in other countries with a view to finding less intrusive alternatives to boarding schools... it should caution government to move slowly and carefully with its current boarding school policy for minority primary age school children.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

The Joint Programme is preparing case studies to analyze the efficiency and effectiveness of the education policies targeting ethnic minority children, including the boarding school policy. A full picture of the effectiveness of ongoing policies will come out after the team completes the study. Once we have the hard evidence on the efficiency and effectiveness of the policies, we would be better prepared to make policy recommendations to the government. Early experience suggests that boarding schools are the only option to ensure and expand basic schooling in the remote and mountainous areas in China. The introduction of local curriculum and bilingual education and the recruitment of local teachers give children opportunities to receive culturally relevant education.

In Year 3, it is planned to share and disseminate the findings of the policy analysis and case studies as well as international best practices and lessons learnt. A planned capacity building workshop will be an opportunity for the team to discuss the findings and international experience with the government. Relevant information will also be shared through a joint MOE-UNICEF knowledge management website. A separate research on what has been done in other countries has not been planned. As it has cost and time implications, this separate research recommended by the evaluator cannot be conducted within the ongoing JP.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
			Comments	Status
1.1 Disseminate findings of policy analysis and case studies as well as int. best practices and lessons learnt	2011	UNESCO & Minzu University		
1.2 Information sharing through the MOE-UNICEF knowledge management website on international experience and global best practices in the education of ethnic minorities	2011	UNICEF		
1.3 Exploratory studies on the	2011	UNICEF		

views of ethnic children and parents on boarding schools as the only option for education				
1.4 Media articles and other high profile ways of bringing the issue to the notice of policy making bodies	2011	UNICEF		

Evaluation Recommendation No. 2: Migration

The JP should work with government to further develop an orientation/training module for migrating minority youth that not only prepares them for their migration experience but which also helps them develop a vision and plan to return to their village with the resources and new skills to develop their village. Government may wish to consider the idea of a re-settlement allowance for migrants wishing to return home for purposes of starting their own business. CDPF should link up with its sister JP the YEM to explore ways and means of further supporting minority migrant youth.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

The Chinese government has already a policy to encourage migrants to return to their hometown and start their own business. In line with this policy and the recommendation, the Programme will provide Start Your Business (SYB) training to returnees. In addition, the recommendation will be shared with YEM for their consideration and also to explore possible synergies.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
2.1 Share recommendation with YEM and explore synergies	Within 1 months	Int. Joint Programme Coordinator (JPC)	Comments	Status
2.2 Provide SYB training to returnees	2010-2011	ILO & MOHRSS		
2.3				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 3: Tourism

Minority villages should be informed of the positive and negative sides of tourism and left to decide whether they want tourism. If they decide to pursue tourism then the JP needs to help them develop codes of conduct for the tourist & villagers & a careful monitoring system to address tourism problems quickly as they emerge. Villages should be encouraged to benefit from tourism at arms' length by having individuals or groups from the village perform in other centers and by producing handicrafts for sale in urban centers. The JP may wish to examine the Bhutan tourism model which restricts the number of tourists and which caters to high-end tourists at a high cost per day. The JP should advise government to make it illegal for outside entrepreneurs to 'buy' a village for tourism purposes.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

The CDPF has so far assisted communities and local governments to develop community-based village tourism plans. The JP will work with the Community Tourism Management Associations established by the Programme in each village to develop the recommended codes of conduct and develop a village tourism monitoring system.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
3.1 Develop codes of conduct	Within 1 year	Jointly implemented by UNDP, UNESCO, SEAC & CICETE under UNESCO lead	Comments	Status
3.2 Develop a village tourism monitoring system	Within 1 year	Jointly implemented by UNDP, UNESCO, SEAC & CICETE under UNESCO lead		
3.3				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 4: Minority health services

Effort should be devoted to publicizing and promoting where possible the fact that health and service gaps in ethnic minority areas are still large and that continued attention to underserved areas is required should MDG4 and 5 be achieved equitably; the importance of specific policies (e.g. maternity waiting rooms) to increase access of the most vulnerable population groups; the need for quality and disaggregated data for decision making; the need for language and culturally appropriate health education materials; the need for a collaborative and participatory approach while designing and implementing health promotion strategies; and the importance of improving the technical skills but also the attitudes and communication skills of the health worker.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Under the health output, the Programme will among other things continue to publicize the fact that health and service gaps in ethnic minority areas are still large and continued attention is needed, introduce specific policies/interventions such as maternity waiting rooms to increase access of the most vulnerable, conduct an endline survey, conduct culturally appropriate client education, design and implement health promotion strategies in a collaborative, participatory manner, and improve the technical skills, attitudes and communication skills of health workers.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
4.1 Draw attention to health and service gaps in ethnic minority areas, incl. through advocacy toolkit and through dissemination of results at CDPF closing ceremony	ongoing	All participating agencies working under output 1.3	Comments	Status
4.2 Continue to	ongoing	UNICEF & MOH		

introduce interventions such as maternity waiting rooms to increase access of the most vulnerable				
4.3 Conduct endline survey	Towards the end of Year 3	All participating agencies working under output 1.3	Ensure dissemination of results	
4.4 Conduct culturally appropriate client education & design and implement participatory health promotion strategies	ongoing	UNICEF, UNFPA, MOH & NPFPC		
4.5 Improve technical skills, attitudes and communication skills of health workers	ongoing	UNICEF, UNFPA, MOH & NPFPC		
4.6 Provide local small entrepreneurs with occupational health and safety knowledge as part of Improve Your Business training	Aug/Sep 2010	ILO & MOHRSS		
<p>Evaluation Recommendation No. 5: A national conference</p> <p>CDPF achievements should be shared more broadly in China. One way of doing so is to hold a national conference at the JP's conclusion to showcase achievements, techniques and lessons learned. The conference might be held in Kunming or Guizhou to focus attention directly on the minority areas. CDPF pilots, success stories and lessons learned need to be documented over the next 18 months so that they can be showcased in the conference.</p>				
<p>Response from the Joint Programme Management</p> <p>In light of serious budget limitations (see also Year 3 AWP), holding a major national conference might not be feasible. However, as mentioned in the MTE final report the Programme is holding a national policy workshop this autumn the results of which will feed into national planning processes. Depending on availability of budget, the JP will also consider holding a closing ceremony similarly in scale to the launching ceremony.</p>				
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
5.1 Organize national policy workshop	Autumn 2010	UNDP, UNESCO, SEAC & CICETE	Comments	Status
5.2 Organize	Autumn 2011	PMC Co-Chairs &		

closing ceremony (provided availability of budget)		JPCs		
5.3 Disseminate major CDPF achievements and findings among pertinent UN partners through the UN Theme Groups	Autumn 2011	UN PMC Co-Chair & Int. JPC		
<p>Evaluation Recommendation No. 6: A national minorities village-head training/counselling programme</p> <p>In one of its other poverty alleviation projects, UNDP and SEAC have developed a training manual and training for village heads. This manual could be further developed from CDPF and other donor/government experiences into a national training/counselling programme to be run by the government or contracted to local NGOs. The curriculum for this course would cover such topics as the basics of village planning and management, socio-economic development, local tourism development and guidelines, environmental management, how to benefit from migration, cultural preservation and development and health and education management.</p>				
<p>Response from the Joint Programme Management</p> <p>The existing training manual will be further developed and tested under the CDPF.</p>				
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
6.1 Further develop and test training manual	2010-2011	UNDP, SEAC & CICETE	Comments	Status
6.2				
6.3				
<p>Evaluation Recommendation No. 7: Local road maintenance programme</p> <p>Some countries have a government programme that pays villagers to maintain a portion of the road on either side of their village for a few kilometres. Major road works are still done by the government. This programme would generate revenue for the villagers but equally important, it makes them take pride in themselves and ownership over the road.</p>				
<p>Response from the Joint Programme Management</p> <p>The recommendation will be shared with relevant local counterparts.</p>				
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
7.1 Share recommendation with local counterparts	Within 1 month	SEAC	Comments	Status
7.2				
7.3				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 8: Village environment programme

Government and the donor community may wish to pursue the notion of a village-based environmental programme. The programme would pay villagers to develop their own project based on their values and traditions for work on small local environmental projects such as tree planting, trail construction and maintenance, water and sanitation works, etc.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Participating agencies take note of this recommendation and will keep it in mind when developing future programmes.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
8.1			Comments	Status
8.2				
8.3				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 9: Regular local radio/TV programme in minority language

There is no minority language programming on radio or TV in Congjiang and Leishan counties. Experience in other countries shows that minority language programming is a powerful instrument to inform people of government services, to educate them about basic health practices and to help maintain and develop their language and culture. Consider mounting some pilots in collaboration with local TV/radio stations.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

The Programme takes note of this recommendation and will keep it in mind for future programmes as it will not be possible to initiate such pilots from scratch within the limited time and budget left to the CDPF.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
9.1			Comments	Status
9.2				
9.3				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 10: CDPF websites

The UN has and SEAC is developing CDPF websites. Since a central purpose of this JP is policy advice to government it is important that these sites be complete with all documents, presentations and videos produced by the JP and that the sites be kept up to date on a regular basis. It will be important to 'advertise' these sites to interested parties in government, the media and the donor community. The sites should be interactive so that CDPF can learn stakeholders' views and suggestions.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

The CDPF website developed by the UN is being regularly updated. Increased efforts will be made to upload programme documents and publications. The RCO is, moreover, planning to post a database of all publications produced by the MDG-F Joint Programmes on the UN China website. It should be noted that the CDPF website is part of the official UN website in China and thus the development of certain features, e.g. interactive ones, depends also on the availability of these features on the UN China website. The CDPF website developed by SEAC is still under development.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
10.1 Upload CDPF programme documents to UN China website as they become available	ongoing	Participating UN agencies & Int. JPC	Comments	Status
10.2 Post database of publications produced by MDG-F JPs on UN China website	Within next 3 months	RCO		
10.3 Complete development of SEAC-sponsored CDPF website	Within next 3 months	SEAC		
<p>Evaluation Recommendation No. 11: UNCT to link CDPF with other development projects</p> <p>The UNCT may wish to do a survey of other related donor initiatives and to link up with this work so as to maximize impact.</p>				
<p>Response from the Joint Programme Management</p> <p>This recommendation will be shared with the UNCT.</p>				
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
11.1 Share recommendation with UNCT	Within 1 month	RCO	Comments	Status
11.2				
11.3				
<p>Evaluation Recommendation No. 12: Strengthen training</p> <p>More emphasis – trainers and resources – should be placed on training in the second half of the JP as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training needs assessments should be done before all training; • Training should be targeted at specific groups without too many trainees in the room so that the message can be focused and participation assured. If trainees are to be brought together from different target groups then the training must allow sufficient time to address all topics; • Training materials should be tested before the training and adjusted to make sure they work; • Each training session should be evaluated with a simple one page set of questions to trainees to determine whether trainees understood and found it useful and adjustments made for the next training session; 				

- Attention should be given to women trainees and their needs;
- SEAC should take more advantage of the UN agencies and their perspective/assistance in the design and delivery of training;
- Training should take advantage of local minority organizations such as the folk organizations to assist with training;
- Training should be more of a mentoring system whereby classroom training is complemented with a follow-on mentoring programme where the trainer gives the trainee exercises to do and the trainee is in contact with the trainer as a coach;
- Field missions should always include a ‘training’ session with villagers;
- Consideration should be given to the merit in a training-of-trainers initiative to enhance JP impact and sustainability;

Implementation of these recommendations would benefit from the contracting of a training consultant or organization to design and implement the training intervention across all JP outputs.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

The agencies that conduct training activities take note of the recommendation and will strengthen their activities where applicable (for further information refer also to our response to the MTE draft report). To contract one training consultant/organization for all JP outputs is not feasible given the wide range of issues being addressed by the CDPF.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
12.1 Strengthen CDPF training activities in line with recommendation	ongoing	All participating agencies that conduct training activities	Comments	Status
12.2				
12.3				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 13: Minority youth vocational certification programme

A CDPF consultant has proposed a vocational certification programme for artisans by the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security. The JP should pursue this concept in the time remaining with a view to having a policy proposal for government to consider.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Agencies collaborating under output 2.3 take note of the recommendation and will explore its feasibility in the short period of time left to the programme.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
13.1 Integrate “supportive measures for the ethnic minority intangible cultural	Autumn 2010	ILO, UNESCO, UNDP, UNIDO, MOHRSS, SEAC, CACA & CICETE	Comments	Status

heritage and cultural industries through development of career path for the youth” in policy recommendations for China’s 12 th Five-Year-Plan				
13.2				
13.3				
Evaluation Recommendation No. 14: JP deficit				
<p>The budget deficit needs to be addressed now by one or more of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mobilize the required funding; • Cut each output budget by a certain percent; • Terminate activities where early results are sufficient; • Terminate activities which are problematic or not likely to bring results; • Scale back or combine field missions; • Combine or eliminate contracted JP expertise. 				
Response from the Joint Programme Management				
<p>The budget deficit has been addressed in the course of the development of the Year 3 Annual Work Plan and is waiting for final approval by the PMC and NSC.</p>				
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
14.1 Approve Yr 3 AWP	Before end of October 2010	PMC & NSC	Comments	Status
14.2				
14.3				
Evaluation Recommendation No. 15: Cut down on field missions				
<p>The number of field missions should be controlled. The National and International JP Coordinators should be informed about all planned missions with a view to combining and/or eliminating superfluous missions for the balance of the JP.</p>				
Response from the Joint Programme Management				
<p>Participating agencies will renew their efforts to inform JPCs about planned missions in advance with a view to combine missions or eliminate superfluous ones.</p>				
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
15.1 Inform JPCs about planned missions in advance	ongoing	All participating agencies	Comments	Status
15.2				
15.3				
Evaluation Recommendation No. 16: Position MDG-F JPs closer to their target groups				

This JP is centralized at the national level. The JP might have been better structured if it was located in the provincial or even the county seats with funding and management at this level. It is not too late to put more funding and decision-making down at the county and even village level in this JP.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Participating agencies will take this recommendation into account when planning for year 3.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up	
16.1 Allocate more funding and decision-making to county and village levels where feasible	During AWP preparation and afterwards	All participating agencies	Comments	Status
16.2				
16.3				