



# FINAL NARRATIVE REPORT

**Turkey**

Thematic window  
Culture & Development

**Joint Programme Title:**

Alliances for Culture Tourism (ACT) in Eastern  
Anatolia

---

October | **2012**

---

# Prologue

The [MDG Achievement Fund](#) was established in 2007 through a landmark agreement signed between the Government of Spain and the UN system. With a total contribution of approximately USD 900 million, the MDG-Fund has financed 130 joint programmes in eight Thematic Windows, in 50 countries around the world.

The joint programme final narrative report is prepared by the joint programme team. It reflects the final programme review conducted by the Programme Management Committee and National Steering Committee to assess results against expected outcomes and outputs.

The report is divided into five (5) sections. Section I provides a brief introduction on the socio economic context and the development problems addressed by the joint programme, and lists the joint programme outcomes and associated outputs. Section II is an assessment of the joint programme results. Section III collects good practices and lessons learned. Section IV covers the financial status of the joint programme; and Section V is for other comments and/or additional information.

We thank our national partners and the United Nations Country Team, as well as the joint programme team for their efforts in undertaking this final narrative report.

MDG-F Secretariat

**FINAL MDG-F JOINT PROGRAMME  
NARRATIVE REPORT**

<p align="center"><b>Participating UN Organization(s)</b></p> <p>UNDP (lead agency) UNESCO, UNICEF, UNWTO</p>	<p align="center"><b>Sector(s)/Area(s)/Theme(s)</b></p> <p>Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies by recognizing pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighbouring countries</p>
---	--

<p align="center"><b>Joint Programme Title</b></p> <p>Alliances for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia</p>	<p align="center"><b>Joint Programme Number</b></p> <p><b>1792</b></p>
---	--

<p align="center"><b>Joint Programme Cost [Sharing - if applicable]</b></p> <p><b>[Fund Contribution):</b> USD</p> <p><b>Govt. Contribution:</b> USD</p> <p><b>Agency Core Contribution:</b></p> <p><b>Other:</b></p> <p><b>TOTAL:</b> 3,800,000 USD</p>	<p align="center"><b>Joint Programme [Location]</b></p> <p><b>Region (s):</b> Eastern Anatolia/Turkey</p> <p><b>Governorate(s):</b> Kars</p> <p><b>District(s):</b> Kars</p>
--	--

<p align="center"><b>Final Joint Programme Evaluation</b></p> <p><b>Final Evaluation Done</b> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/></p> <p><b>Evaluation Report Attached</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><b>Date of delivery of final report</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Joint Programme Timeline</b></p> <p><b>Original start date</b> December 2008</p> <p><b>Final end date</b> May 2012</p>
---	---

**Participating Implementing Line Ministries and/or other organisations (CSO, etc)**  
**Ministry of Culture and Tourism of Turkey, Ministry of Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of National Education, Ministry of Family and Social Policies, (Please see the List: Annex I)**

**Report Formatting Instructions:**

- Number all sections and paragraphs as indicated below.
- Format the entire document using the following font: 12point \_ Times New Roman.

## I. PURPOSE

### a. Provide a brief introduction on the socio economical context and the development problems addressed by the programme.

Provinces of Eastern Anatolia are the poorest in Turkey with human development (HDI) levels far below national averages. Policy options are limited for the people of the region to attain economic and social opportunities: “In the short and middle term, the important economic potential of the region appears to be in the commercial and tourism sectors. The region has highly valuable cultural assets that are little known in the world. Incentives in these areas have a high chance of success (for poverty reduction)” (UNDP-Turkey, 2006). Kars is situated at the northern tip of the Eastern Anatolia region and lies in the heart of the South Caucasus at a strategic position of the Turkey’s border, which intersects with Armenia, Georgia and Iran. It has an HDI value of 0.644 compared to the national average of 0.757. Poverty rates in Kars are estimated to be around 30 percent (31 percent based on poverty certificates issued) compared to 17 percent for national averages. Kars is home to the ancient city of Ani which is one of the richest areas of medieval art and architecture. Many cultures have left their traces in the region. Turkey is committed to the highest standards of conservation and protection of these areas in line with the applicable conventions.

Tourism is a major economic force in Turkey; however, the vast bulk of this activity occurs in the west and south of the country, with receipts in north eastern Anatolia estimated at less than 1% of the national total. Cultural tourism currently accounts for around 8-12% of incoming tourism in terms of motivation of visit, but it is anticipated that this market share may expand to around 20% or more in the next ten years. In Eastern Anatolia, cultural assets can provide a catalyst for this process, with sustainable tourism providing a link between them and poverty reduction. The challenge lies in linking the cultural and tourism potentials of this region to local economic growth and to ensure that these assets are leveraged in the national and regional development plans targeting the region.

The cultural heritage of people is the memory of its living culture. It takes many different forms, both tangible (monuments, landscapes, objects) and intangible (languages, know-how, performing arts, music and the like) and this holistic approach to heritage contributes to its integration in the society and the recognition of its triple role as a foundation of identity, a vector for development and a tool for reconciliation. Activities of heritage protection referring to internationally recognized standard setting instruments will contribute to incorporate their principles in local and regional policies and to link the normative and the operational, and the global to the local. Such an approach will enable culture to contribute to development and revenue generation and demonstrate that “culture counts” while preserving its authenticity and integrity and the values, and meanings it contains to be enhanced by present generations and to be handed to future ones. Collaborative efforts between the national and local authorities, the civil society and the private sector in Eastern Anatolia and in Kars are helpful for fostering this type of appreciation and will contribute to social cohesion, especially among young women and men, with regard to matters of culture. The very good initiatives of local authorities and civil society in fostering this appreciation lack strategic outlook and suffer from lack of resources and expertise.

### b. List joint programme outcomes and associated outputs as per the final approved version of the joint programme Document or last agreed revision.

Major achievements		
Development of institutional capacities and regulatory frameworks	Increase of communities’ capacities and enterprises in Kars	Promotion of social cohesion and dialogue

<p>- Cooperation between national and local authorities strengthened and local authorities' institutional and professional capacities developed in the safeguarding, management and promotion of cultural heritage, and its integration into sustainable tourism development processes/policies/activities</p> <p>Cultural policies strengthened and implemented more effectively at National and Local level (capacities enhanced for the implementation of the 2003 Convention for Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage, and completion of National Inventory forms) ( The field research covered 80 villages; 50 students and 4 senior researchers from Kafkas University were involved and trained. Approximately 7000 pages of data transcriptions, 2000 photographs, 260 video recording have been collected and made available on the official web pages of the University and the UNJP);</p> <p>Capacities enhanced and related tools developed for the management of tangible cultural heritage (ArcGIS software and automated system developed for the creation and management of digital data on conservation, monitoring and supervision of registered sites and immovable cultural and natural assets in the province of Kars and activated. Revision and update and integration of existing official map of Ani completed. Draft management plan for the site of Ani developed and finalised, with participation of all relevant stakeholders, including the development of stakeholders' capacities in the planning and implementation phase) (2643 files containing 852 Regional Board decisions, 920 identification cards, 295 rehabilitation projects, 82 plans and maps, 44 principle</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Capacities developed of local non-governmental partners and other stakeholders from the local civil society, in the safeguarding, management and promotion of cultural heritage, and its integration into sustainable tourism development processes/policies/activities</li> <li>- Capacities developed of local stakeholders in the planning and implementation of heritage management tools; in particular, the involvement of the local communities was ensured during the preparation of the Management Plan Framework and draft management plan for the site of Ani;</li> <li>- Tour Operators Survey and Tourism Cluster Road Map elaborated;</li> <li>- Tourism related trainings delivered by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism to 268 people, 38% of which are women;</li> <li>- Awareness-raising and informative/promotional materials on local cultural heritage produced (CDs and books on intangible cultural heritage such as publication on "Folk Tales from Minstrels" and Eastern Anatolian Folk Tales collection; book on "Mapping Intangible Cultural Heritage of Kars Province"; brochures for awareness-raising on the safeguarding of cultural heritage and relevant legislative framework at national level, etc.);</li> <li>- Tourism promotion and marketing: brochures, documentary film, map on Kars province; participation in three international tourism fairs (in Istanbul in February 2010, in Moscow in March 2010 and in ITB Berlin in March 2011), a live radio show on TRT (National Broadcasting Agency);</li> <li>- Contribution to the improvement of artisans and technical support in order to create a platform for training in making and performing traditional instruments "saz" and "tar" and establishment of a chorus comprised of mostly youngsters including</li> </ul>	<p>International Minstrels Festival organised (with the participation of Minstrels from different regions and provinces of Turkey and from neighbouring countries) (120 Minstrels from Turkey and abroad participated. The 6<sup>th</sup> International Minstrels Festival was held between 24-26 June through the Municipality, with exceptional participation of performers from Turkey and abroad (Kyrgyzstan, Georgia, Azerbaijan and Iran);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Children Museum Training Modules on cultural heritage delivered in 8 cities;</li> <li>- Social network created and strengthened: a platform for discussions and expression of opinions created for civil society;</li> <li>- Participatory process involving central and local authorities as well as civil societies leading to established partnerships, with an inclusive approach;</li> </ul> <p>-Brochures aiming at raising awareness at both local and national level on the legislative and normative framework for the safeguarding of cultural heritage in distributed in 81 provinces of Turkey. ( The preparation and publishing of a set of 7 (seven) brochures aimed at raising awareness on the legislative and</p>
--	---	--

<p>decisions and other 450 files have been digitalized, and the software system developed. Feasibility Analysis on terrestrial measurements of 20 sites and registered buildings in Province of Kars completed.);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Policy documents elaborated: Tourism Master Plan; Tourism Action Plan; Children Museum Training Kit; Ani Site Management Plan Framework approved in preparation of the draft 5-year Ani Site Management Plan according to current legislative framework ; Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage Basic Texts Booklet.</li> <li>- The JP has established models, good practices and methodologies for up-scaling/replication elsewhere, even beyond Turkey (e.g. Ani Site Management Plan, Children Museum Rooms, Training Modules for technical/managerial skills for income generation and micro and small business development, Mapping of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Kars Province through the cooperation with the Kafkas University)</li> <li>-</li> </ul>	<p>women ;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Methodologies of cooperation at national and local level introduced (Cooperation Agreement signed by the Municipality, Ministry of Culture and Tourism and Minstrels Association for the establishment of a “Culture House” dedicated to the promotion and safeguarding of Minstrels Tradition. As a result, a platform created for the Minstrels to meet, practice and perform Minstrel Tradition to ensure its safeguarding and viability. The library within the Culture House has been enriched through the purchase of books on the Minstrel Tradition. Traditional Music instruments have also been provided).</li> <li>- Promotional tour for Kars organized by local stakeholders;</li> <li>- Public-private cooperation established, for example info tour for national tour agents and media;</li> <li>- It has both upstream dimension in terms of formulation of Tourism Development Strategy (based on culture, nature and winter sports), Sustainable Tourism Development Action Plan and establishment of Tourism Development Organization, as well as downstream income generating and poverty alleviation interventions with focus on women entrepreneurs;</li> <li>- Local level consultative processes managed with the participation of private sector, local authorities and civil society to develop roadmaps for tourism sector development on selected priority areas in line with Kars Tourism Strategy;</li> <li>- It has introduced 33 specific tourism related products for marketing and has supported SME’s thus creating income generation activities and opportunities;</li> <li>- In order to support the local development initiatives 8 grant projects were implemented to support</li> </ul>	<p>normative framework for the safeguarding of cultural heritage in Turkey has been completed (7000 copies printed and delivered to MoCT, for use at local and national level. The brochures have been subsequently revised according to the amendments to the legal framework introduced in 2011, and reprinted in additional 7000 copies to be distributed to the museums, tourism information centers and other heritage institutions in 81 provinces of Turkey)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Promotion of cultural diversity through the mapping of intangible cultural heritage via field research in 80 villages involving 50 trained students from the Kafkas University. It was a participatory process with the targeted population and a special care was given to reflect and respect the cultural diversity of the target area</li> <li>- Gender balance approach was ensured as a cross-cutting priority throughout the implementation of the entire JP, and special attention was given to activities related to women-led initiatives (e.g. in the selection of projects to be financed by the grant scheme)</li> </ul>
--	--	--

	<p>the infrastructural and organizational efforts that will meet the immediate requirements for further development of tourism industry in Kars, and to build good examples for future replication.</p>	
--	---	--

Outcome: Pro-poor sectoral (tourism) development policies implemented with framework of social (cohesion) integration policies by fostering pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighbouring countries by 2010.

Outputs:

1. A model for strategic direction, prioritization and coordination of cultural heritage protection and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars.
  - 1.1. Policy for protection and enhancement of cultural assets in Kars and environs developed and presented for adoption by national authorities.
  - 1.2. Site and tourism management planning and implementation capacities of local and national managers of cultural assets in Eastern Anatolia.
  - 1.3. A cultural tourism strategy and action plan agreed to by national authorities within the context of the "Brand City" program and the Tourism Strategy 2023.
  - 1.4. New information delivery and marketing system established in Kars.
2. Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in the culture based tourism sector.
  - 2.1. Capacities of existing enterprises strengthened and community initiatives started.
  - 2.2. Systems for enterprise support and development established in line with applicable EU regional development and competitiveness strategies.
3. Local authorities and civil society in Kars and its environs and other relevant provinces promote social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism.
  - 3.1. Capacities of local authorities, civil society and youth on the role of culture in building identity, social cohesion and dialogue built.
  - 3.2. Local participatory governance structures enhanced to promote and manage social cohesion programs through fostering of pluralism.
  - 3.3. Children's understanding of cultural diversity and ability to resolve conflict increased through the provision of cultural and life skills based education programmes within the Child's Rights Committees of İstanbul, Ankara, Eskisehir, Kayseri, Sivas, Erzincan, Erzurum and Kars.

**c. Explain the overall contribution of the joint programme to National Plan and Priorities.**

The Joint Program was implemented based on existent national strategies, including the Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013), the Government's Tourism and Strategy Action Plan of 2007-2013 and the 2023 Tourism Strategy. Thereby, national ownership was ensured through the effective cohesion of program outputs with the institutional set up of management of cultural policy and cultural tourism in the country and of program targets with those of the relevant national authorities.

On the other hand, the joint programme has also contributed to the debate on development of sustainable/community based tourism in Turkey. The experience and lessons learned throughout the JP period were instrumental in developing new initiatives with the Ministry of Culture and Tourism for supporting the capacities of local and other central actors for development of the sustainable/community based tourism. Such support includes improvement of legislative framework and strengthening the dialogue with various actors engaged in management of cultural

assets and tourism. The experience generated throughout the Programme will also be incorporated as appropriate into the 10<sup>th</sup> National Development Plan, the preparations of which have been launched in summer 2012.

**d. Describe and assess how the programme development partners have jointly contributed to achieve development results.**

The Tourism Master Plan and the Marketing Plan (including a detailed 3-year Action Plan) were developed on the basis of the above-mentioned national strategies.

As indicated in the Joint Programme document, the outcomes and outputs of the partner Agencies activities are interrelated. Activities of UN partner agencies were demand-driven by the national implementation partner(s). Leadership from central ministerial units was also required for local authorities to contribute to project results effectively. Although the partnerships of the program are interlinked in a mutually supportive manner, each UN agency had its primary partner within the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. Each of the agency outputs of the Joint Programme are aligned to the mandates and plans of a particular unit within the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. In addition, as referred in the evaluation report the logic of the programme indicates that if cultural awareness is raised it would be easier and more sustainable to work on “*developing capacities*” and “*promoting a conducive policy environment*”. Equally, it is also observed that if capacities are developed, the policy environment is conducive and the right tools are in place, this will translate into income generation activities that will contribute to the economic development of the area through cultural tourism. So, the “*income generation activities*” were considered as a stimulus to create awareness and build capacities. UNESCO together with UNICEF were the two agencies more involved at the level of “*awareness raising*” (mapping of intangible ICH, brochures on the legislative and normative framework for the safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Turkey, Children’s room in the Museums, etc.). UNESCO, in particular, focused on ensuring the sustainability of cultural resources with a view at their integration into tourism development processes, by improving their safeguarding and management. Besides, the results of the Mapping of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Kars Province provided information on traditional children games and toys which were inspired and used during the establishment of Children Museum Rooms. The strong cooperation between all UN Agency partners during the selection and carrying out of the Grant Scheme Programme is another proof of the common objective and interrelated results of the activities. UNDP used the Tourism Master Plan as a reference document during the Grant Scheme Programme. UNWTO together with UNDP conducted a Study Tour and organized the participation to the National and International Tourism Fairs together with UNWTO in order to increase the awareness, promote the Kars and the Eastern Anatolia Region and increase the ownership and cooperation among relevant stakeholders. Besides this, these achievements created a suitable environment for information exchange and built partnership between culture and tourism industries. UNDP and UNWTO also developed a Tourism Web Site for Kars and Eastern Anatolia in order to provide a suitable environment to promote Kars and the Region and also create a network among relevant parties. UNESCO together with UNWTO and UNDP worked intensively on components intending to build capacities for the private and the public sector and on promoting a conducive policy environment and appropriate tools for safeguarding of cultural assets in a complementary manner (such as, Tourism Master Plan, Ani Site Management Plan, Digitization of tangible Cultural Heritage, establishment of a culture house, Clustering methodology, etc.). Synergies have been produced among the different components. In some cases it has been due to a good design that enabled the work of different UN agencies under the same output. In other cases (most of them) the synergies have appeared due to the good collaborative approach of the stakeholders and the frequent information sharing and learning provided by the JP team. The PMC and the coordination within the UNJP team have been fundamental while creating these synergies. It is also observed that the synergy between local and national level was fundamental in the successful achievements and completion of activities. A good example of how these synergies happened by design is the interrelation among the mapping of Intangible Cultural Heritage, the Tourism Master Plan, the Ani Site Management Plan and the Peer to peer trainings for the Children’s Room in the Museums. The early results of the ICH mapping prepared by UNESCO were fed into the Tourism Action Plan led by UNWTO. Part of the Tourism Action Plan was also fed into the Ani Site Management Plan Development Framework. Also some of the mapping of ICH was fed into the peer to peer training



organized by UNICEF. Similarly, UNDP supported tourism related trainings in line with the Tourism Action Plan and also contributed to the promotion of Kars tourism potential through development of promotional kits, maps and finally a web site.

## **II. ASSESSMENT OF JOINT PROGRAMME RESULTS**

- a. Report on the key outcomes achieved and explain any variance in achieved versus planned results. The narrative should be results oriented to present results and illustrate impacts of the pilot at policy level.**

**Support to the safeguarding and promotion of cultural diversity and cultural heritage, with a special focus on intangible cultural heritage and the diversity of cultural expressions**

### **Outcomes:**

- Awareness-raised and capacities developed for the implementation of relevant international standards, with special reference to the UNESCO 2003 Convention on the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage.
- National inventory process for intangible cultural heritage in Kars and neighboring provinces advanced (2 workshops organized for local stakeholders at local and regional level, including 13 provinces in Eastern Anatolia, on the preparation of forms for the national inventory making of intangible cultural heritage)
- Awareness raised, information gathered and processed, and capacities developed on the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage in the province of Kars (realisation and publishing of a research for the mapping of intangible cultural heritage in the province of Kars. Selected data were presented in form of a publication, and the overall research outcome submitted to MoCT for their archives and further processing.);
- Kars' intangible cultural heritage promoted and awareness raised on its richness and diversity, through the production and distribution of books and audiovisual materials (production of a book with audio CD on traditional folk tale; production of an audio CD presenting a selection of Minstrels' performances) and the organization of public events (organisation of 2 international Minstrels' festivals in Kars, with the participation of neighbouring countries, 120 Minstrels; 5 women Minstrel, and an audience of 5000 in Kars, Kağızman and Sarıkamış)
- Viability reinforced and capacities developed for the safeguarding and promotion of the Minstrelsy tradition, as Kars' most renowned intangible cultural heritage element, already inscribed in the UNESCO Representative List of Intangible Cultural heritage of humanity (rehabilitation and opening of a Culture House dedicated to the art of Minstrelsy; agreement established between Minstrels Association, Kars Municipality and the Ministry of Culture and Tourism; professionals trained in the making of traditional musical instruments, "saz" and "tar"; minstrels festival organized; books and CDs produced on Minstrelsy tradition)
- Overall awareness raised on the concept and value of intangible cultural heritage, both at the level of relevant local authorities, and with the regard to the heritage bearers (individuals, groups, communities)
- Main assets of Kars' intangible cultural heritage assessed and properly integrated into cultural tourism development processes, with a view at ensuring their sustainability.

### **Creation of a Model for Strategic Direction, Prioritization and Safeguarding of Tangible Cultural Heritage**

#### **Outcomes:**

- Capacities enhanced in the planning and implementation of management tools, with special reference to the preparation of a draft management plan for the site of Ani with participative approach, ensuring the involvement, networking and cooperation of all relevant stakeholders (central and local authorities, site managers, individual professionals, civil society, local communities, etc.). This was mostly achieved through the support offered to the preparation of a management plan for the Site of Ani, which is the main cultural assets and potentially the most important cultural attraction in the project area. In particular, the UNJP initiated and led

the process for the definition of the draft management plan, providing technical assistance and activating partnerships between all relevant stakeholders, with an inclusive participatory approach. This is resulted in a decisive improvement in the safeguarding and management of cultural and natural sites in the project area, and paved the way for their better and sustainable integration into the local tourism development programmes.

- The activities for the preparation of the Ani Site Management Plan also determined an increase of funds allocated by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism for the conservation and restoration of the site of Ani (ca. 375.000 Euros in 2009, and 350.000 in 2010).
- Capacities developed for the registering, conservation, and monitoring of natural and cultural heritage in the province of Kars, through the establishment and activation of a digital automated system. As an indirect result, the activities for the creation of the automated system also determined acceleration in the establishment of the Local Conservation Council in Kars, which was long planned by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and eventually opened in 2011.
- Furthermore, the activities brought along significant results in terms of training, institutional and professional capacity building (both at central and local level), awareness raising (concerning institutions, practitioners, and civil society at large in the involved communities), as well as the establishment of partnerships between the central state authorities, the local government agencies, and the stakeholders for the academic sector and the civil society.
- As a result of the capacity-building action, and of the creation of related operational tools, the conditions were created for ensuring the sustainable integration of local cultural heritage into tourism development processes.

#### Within Overall Output 1.3:

- i. A complete qualitative and quantitative audit of Kars tourism facilities and services was carried out with the support of UNWTO Volunteers Programme;
- ii. A survey of selected international and national tour operators on current and potential interest of Kars as a tourism destination was conducted;
- iii. The Tourism Master Plan was elaborated in cooperation with the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and local stakeholders from Kars (approved by the Government of Turkey and UN agencies in December 2010).
- iv. An assessment of the institutional capacity to develop and manage tourism in Kars was carried out and the possible structure of a Tourism Governance Organization was elaborated; and
- v. A three-day workshop was held in Kars in May 2010 including 26 local stakeholders with the collaboration of UNDP and UNESCO with the purpose of (i) consulting on the Tourism Master Plan and (ii) establishing the framework of a TGO for Kars.

#### Within Overall Output 1.4:

- i. Capacity building activities on promotion and information delivery with local stakeholders and governmental representatives were undertaken during the workshops held in the course of the study tour to Spain in December 2009;
- ii. Elaboration and promotion of itineraries within Kars, as well as an evaluation of enhanced use of cultural events were assessed within UNWTO's Volunteers Programme and included in the Tourism Master Plan for Kars;
- iii. Awareness-raising training on cultural heritage within the tourism sector was undertaken during the training programmes conducted in Kars in December 2010;
- iv. Promotional support was provided to Kars in participation at EMITT, ITB, and Kars Tourism Week;
- v. A marketing strategy with a detailed 3-year Action Plan, including guidance for the existing Tourism Information Centre in Kars, was formulated;
- vi. A logo and slogan for Kars were developed;
- vii. Promotional brochures (one general and three thematic brochures focusing on winter, culture and nature tourism products) for Kars were developed;

- viii. A familiarization tour was organized in July 2011. The 15 participants included 5 international tour operators and national public and private sector representatives; and
- ix. A report with detailed research on tourism website development for Kars and draft ToR for a potential designer were formulated with the involvement of 2 UNWTO.Themis Foundation Volunteers.

Within Overall Output 2.1:

- i. A study tour with 32 local stakeholders from Kars was carried out to Spanish tourism destinations in December 2009; and
- ii. An assessment of the tourism use of cultural assets in Kars was conducted (included in the Master Plan).
- iii. 4 representatives from the MoCT, Sarikamis Governorate, SERHAT (sub-regional development agency in Kars), and a private sector representative participated in UNWTO's Practicum in June 2010;
- iv. A training needs assessment was carried out with the objective to establish a baseline assessment of capacity building needs for training programmes in Kars;
- v. In collaboration with an international expert, training programmes were designed based on the training needs assessment including the identification of enterprise opportunities for identified communities and groups and particularly focused on potential enterprise delivery for tourism facilities and services in Kars;
- vi. Training for tourism awareness-raising (51 participants) and hotel operations (24 participants) were implemented in December 2010;
- vii. Training in English language (62 participants) was conducted from February to April 2011; and
- viii. Business advisory services for tourism-related and non-tourism-related SMEs (about 50 beneficiaries) were conducted in May 2011.

Within Output 2.2:

- i. The capacities of enterprises and local actors operating in tourism sector were developed particularly for tourism service delivery and promotion.
- ii. Cluster workgroups established to build a local network of stakeholders in tourism. These structures were instrumental in sustainable structures and identified priorities for tourism in Kars. Roadmaps developed by the cluster workgroups were later implemented to support and promote tourism sector. The capacity of such workgroups was further developed with relevant trainings and study tour as mentioned above.
- iii. Local initiatives supported to build best practice examples and contribute to implementation of the Tourism Action Plan.

**b. In what way do you feel that the capacities developed during the implementation of the joint programme have contributed to the achievement of the outcomes?**

The JP activities focusing on cultural heritage (tangible and intangible) offered a decisive contribution to the achievement of the JP outcomes, to the extent that they created the conditions for the safeguarding of this heritage and its sustainable integration into the tourism development processes/activities. Indeed, the JP approach was based on the assumption that the safeguarding of cultural heritage is a sine-qua-non for ensuring sustainability of any cultural tourism.

In particular, the JP provided concrete contributions to the safeguarding and promotion of the intangible cultural heritage, through a set of complementary activities carried out in parallel and aimed on the one hand to raise-awareness on the concept of intangible cultural heritage, and on the other to support its safeguarding and viability. These activities were comprised of the identification and mapping of the main intangible cultural assets in the Kars province, and the support to selected manifestations of this heritage, with special attention to the Minstrelsy tradition. The methodology used to supporting the Minstrelsy Tradition for transmission through written form, creating a platform for the making and performing of traditional instruments, contributing to promotion, and providing a culture house, all formed a solid basis for further activities to be held for the safeguarding and viability of this tradition. The Minstrelsy tradition is mostly practiced by men as it is an art associated with travelling, and very few women, are associated with the tradition. These women are mainly from

Sivas, Çorum and Eskişehir and not from Kars. Through the JP, women from Kars are both exposed to this tradition and also encouraged to learn and practice it. The most important component of this initiative was the establishment of the Culture House, and the memorandum of understanding signed for this purpose between the Municipality of Kars and the Minstrels Association which will ensure the continuity and sustainability of related activities beyond the end of the project. Along the same line, the JP supported the preparation and publishing of a book on Eastern Anatolian Folk Tales, which will allow further promoting and safeguarding oral traditions as a distinctive feature of the local intangible cultural heritage. This comprehensive approach to the safeguarding of the tradition and model to support local and national authorities, particularly for the elements inscribed in UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity is a good practice as the modality of cooperation, namely the agreement between a Local Association and Municipality, and series of complementary activities can easily be replicated in other contexts and provinces of Turkey.

- ✓ Awareness was raised concerning all stakeholders (from relevant authorities, to the communities of bearers, to local civil society at large) on the nature, importance and value of Intangible cultural heritage
- ✓ A good cooperation model was established for the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage
- ✓ Intangible cultural heritage from the target area was greatly promoted and the instruments created for its further promotion at local, national and international level
- ✓ Tools, resources and processes were made available for supporting the safeguarding, viability and transmission of local intangible heritage, with special focus on the minstrelsy tradition
- ✓ Local intangible cultural heritage was better integrated into processes and policies for the sustainable development of cultural tourism
- ✓ The ownership from local communities and authorities was ensured
- ✓ The overall experience may serve as a model for the establishment of other culture houses and the creation of platforms for different traditions in different contexts.
- ✓ Other municipalities from the same region have already formulated requests for the same kind of support and activities.

UNJP activities concerning strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible cultural heritage allowed the realization of an integrated model for the protection of cultural and natural assets, and paved the way for their sustainability and better integration into the local tourism development programmes. This result, which determined a decisive improvement of the institutional capacities of relevant authorities, was achieved by means of two main sets of interventions:

The planning, realization and activation of an automated system for the creation and management of digital data on conservation, monitoring and supervision of registered sites and immovable cultural and natural assets in the province of Kars. Activities in this sense included the engineering of the system structure and functioning, the development of the software component, the purchase and installation of the hardware component, as well as the training of the system users both at local and national level. The system, designed and realised in close coordination with the Ministry of Cultural Tourism, is the first comprehensive tool for digitisation of cultural heritage ever activated in Eastern Anatolia, and will represent a point of reference for the development of similar structures in the region and all over Turkey.

The support to the preparation of a management plan for the Site of Ani, which is the main cultural assets and potentially the most important cultural attraction in the project area. In particular, the UNJP initiated and led the process for the definition of the draft management plan, providing technical assistance and activating partnerships between all relevant stakeholders, with an inclusive participatory approach. The Site Management Planning is a relatively new subject for Turkey. The first legal disposition was approved in 2004 and specific regulations were introduced in 2005. Since then, only a few management plans have been defined in Turkey in draft form mostly through external procurement for the assignment of related services to external consulting companies. The Ani Site Management Planning process is a model to be possibly replicated in other sites in Turkey and an important achievement, as it introduced for the first time in Turkey a methodology based on international standards and leveraging directly on the institutional structures and capacities of the relevant institutions (mostly, the Ministry of Culture and Tourism).

UNWTO's capacity building programmes adopted two approaches; on the one hand, strengthening of the capacities of the public sector in tourism development, management and promotion at the central level (by involving the Ministry of Culture and Tourism as active partners in the formulation of the Kars Tourism Master Plan, marketing strategy and training programmes) and at the provincial and municipal level (again, by involving Kars Provincial authorities, SERKA and Kars and Sarikamis municipal authorities in the Tourism Master Plan, marketing strategy, training programmes and all other project-related activities especially those related to the setting up of the Tourism Governance Organization). On the other hand, specific training programmes were also conducted for the private sector. Since tourism is an extremely competitive industry, the objective was to provide the local communities with basic skills and knowledge which would allow them to improve the level of tourism services in order to increase competitiveness – training programmes focused on English language, and hospitality and hotel skills (the latter in collaboration with the Human Resource Department of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism). Direct business advisory skills were also provided to tourism and tourism-related entrepreneurs with practical advice, and guidance given to these establishments on how to improve business plans, improve facilities and services, reduce costs and better cater their products and services to meet the needs of the tourism industry. It was felt that capacities developed during the implementation of the joint programme have contributed to the achievement of the outcomes as follows: it demonstrated how tourism can be a viable engine for socio-economic development particularly through the creation of employment for women and youth; the involvement of public stakeholders in the formulation of the Tourism Master Plan, the marketing strategy, the TGO, training activities and promotional campaigns helped to build partnerships and dialogue between at the public-public and public-private sector levels, it encouraged ownerships of the tourism development strategy and demonstrated how tourism development can be integrated into other development plans of the nation in general, and of the Province in particular.

A Sustainable Tourism Conference was organised in January 2012, involving local (Development Agencies, municipalities, NGOs, private sector representatives and tourism associations) and national stakeholders and international experts in a broad discussion about alternative forward looking models and experiences for sustainable tourism. This event was not included as an activity in the project documents. Local capacities on tourism have been further developed through a number of training activities, including one-to-one business advisory services.

Training modules in Museum Education were developed, published and distributed by UNICEF through Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Ministry of National Education, Ministry of Family and Social Policies (former SHCEK) and the University of Ankara (UoA), whose staff informed that the modules are being downloaded by a number of primary school teachers in the country and that other people are showing interest. This activity is planned to be evaluated next year. The friendship train activity was conducted gaining significant media attention and the government is planning to replicate the idea in the near future with a boat trip in the Black Sea. Children's Museum Rooms in Kars and Erzurum are operational and receiving visitors and peer trainings were delivered and extended to other cities beyond the programme. As a result of the JP the government is planning to open a children's museum in Ankara.

The museum training modules developed by UNICEF with the technical support of the University of Ankara includes a specific module on Kars and are being distributed all across the country. Stakeholders believe that this will serve as a promotional tool that will eventually increase the number of tourists visiting Kars.

The Joint Programme had significantly contributed to the systematic building of knowledge and awareness of the importance of cultural heritage (tangible and intangible) as both a past and future asset of the country, particularly among local stakeholders. This is fully aligned with the spirit and rationale of the thematic window's objectives and can therefore be considered a satisfactory contribution.

Empowerment of women was at the core of JP action. The programme has made a significant effort to

mainstream gender and reach women. Although it was not something proactively asked, gender issues and the importance of including women in the activities and benefits of the JP, kept on emerging during interviews with institutional stakeholders. This suggests that, even if not an explicit objective, the JP can legitimately claim some contribution to raising awareness and increasing understanding of the importance of gender equality among both national and local officials. The participatory implementation of this joint intervention, the awareness raised and the high quality of gender mainstreaming are factors that have decisively contributed to enable a conducive local environment for social and political participation and for the inclusion and equal opportunities of both women and men in this particular development process and may constitute a good basis for a stronger civic engagement in Kars in the future.

Capacity building was at the centre of the JP design and most of the activities conducted by all four agencies aimed to strengthen existing capacities at national and local level while providing practical tools and an enabling policy environment for cultural tourism management in Kars.

In total approximately 43 trainings were conducted in areas such as tangible and intangible cultural heritage, site management, project management; children's rights and peer museum education, cluster methodology or marketing and promotion of local products, among many others. Trainings included traditional learning modules and practical and experiential learning such as study tours or one-on-one counseling and have been delivered both by experts provided by the different UN agencies and regular staff from the MoCT. The JP estimates that, as a whole around 630 people were trained, although many of the trainees have probably attended more than one course.

The JP has been to integrate and make use of the expertise and existing capacities of the MoCT. Officials from the Research & Training department have been in charge of delivering some training sessions and the Ministry has fully covered tuition expenses. This has not only reinforced the ownership of the JP by national institutions but, in the words of one interviewee, "has allowed the Ministry to test their own capacities and resources in this particular field".

At local level, some of the methodologies introduced (clusters) and the strategic tools provided, such as the tourism strategy (Tourism Master Plan), are serving to shape the Development Agency grant schemes and are being used as a reference to elaborate and develop tourism plans for other provinces.

UNDP and its community-based approach, the JP has initiated a process of community articulation of the cultural sector around the touristic potentials of its cultural heritage. This means that a lot of effort has been devoted to build relationships between the private and cultural sectors at the local level. But also, and maybe most importantly, significant linkages and bridges have been created between local and national stakeholders. The local level capacity building and networking activities contributed to a sustainable community of tourism actors, which have come together to identify their priorities for tourism development and the planned actions to support such priorities.

At local level, according to many the clusters workshops and the grant scheme have established the embryo of a collaborative culture among the private sector that was previously weak or nonexistent. The grant scheme requested applicants to work in partnership, and some of them continue to do so. For instance KARSOD, the association of hotel owners in Kars, has been implementing some marketing and branding trainings together with Kamer, an association of women producing felt products, a project funded by the MoCT provincial directorate. Finally, the association is also collaborating with students from Kafkas University to organise traditional dance performances in restaurants and hotels in the city, something that was considered rare before the JP by some stakeholders. These are just some of the examples given.

Another important side effect of this JP that was repeatedly mentioned by both national stakeholders and implementing agencies is the bridge built between Kars and national government officials. Although Kars was already part of the Brand City Programme when the JP was launched, through this programme, the province has attracted further attention from central government. The project had provided them with a unique opportunity to learn how to work with local stakeholders (beneficiaries, NGOs, media etc.), making them more aware of the gaps and contradictions of the regulatory

frameworks in practice. Similarly, the strengthened cooperation among the various Departments of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism was also critical in ensuring the success of the JP. This contribution has also been acknowledged by relevant Ministry staff several times and such cooperation is utilized for other initiatives as well (e.g. working group established to work on the legislative framework for sustainable/community based tourism)

The JP has contributed to increased local knowledge and understanding of the distribution of roles and responsibilities among the different institutions with a stake in the cultural tourism sector.

The familiarization tours organised through the project (Study Tour to Spain and Familiarization tour to Kars) were also considered to have the potential to increase the interest of national and international tour operators in the area and eventually bring growth and development. Although no evidence of this could be gathered, it was claimed that some of those tour operators had already shown interest, publicized their visit to Kars on their Web site and some of them had included Kars in their itineraries. Closely related, the participation of local hotels from Kars and Sarikamis in national and international tourism fairs is expected to attract more visitors to the city. The JP had directly contributed to raise the interest of locals in the establishment of bed and breakfast establishments. The number of information requests to their department in this regard has significantly increased since this programme.

The creation of income generation opportunities and job creation in Kars was the final goal of this JP. Cultural tourism is developed as a means to create growth and reduce income disparities with other parts of the country. Apart from the grant scheme initiative no other activity or output of the JP was conceived to directly impact on the economic growth and development of this Eastern Anatolia province.

**c. Report on how outputs have contributed to the achievement of the outcomes based on performance indicators and explain any variance in actual versus planned contributions of these outputs. Highlight any institutional and/or behavioural changes, including capacity development, amongst beneficiaries/right holders.**

The JP has succeeded in building solid working relations with government counterparts in the tourism sector at national level and local level, the creation of operational and policy tools as well as the development of professional and institutional capacities should be considered as very important elements in ensuring the future sustainability of the JP's results.

The great number of participants and the diversity of beneficiaries, partners and stakeholders, such as the NGO's, universities, local authorities was of the most important indicator taken into consideration while defining institutional or behavioral changes. To reach the greatest number of different target beneficiaries was one of the main aim in order to achieve intercultural dialogue and social cohesion, via ensuring the respect of local cultural diversity. The local communities' interest in improving their knowledge about tangible and intangible cultural assets of their province and consciousness about the importance of safeguarding has been proved through their effective participations to the interventions realized. The creation of a strong cooperation among national and local partners is another important aspect of the achievement.

The adoption of the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage reserves a central role to the local communities in the process of identification of the intangible cultural assets. As regards actions in support of the national inventorying of ICH, it shall be noted that the inventory-making is considered as one of the necessary conditions to ensure the sustainable safeguarding of ICH and it is one of the priority actions that the signatory parties of the UNESCO convention must undertake for the Convention's implementation. The preparation of the national inventory for intangible cultural heritage within the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage criteria reflecting the cultural diversity of the target area in agreement

with relevant international standards was another indicator to evaluate the implementation. Ministry of Culture and Tourism has already reported the increase in the quantity and quality of forms particularly received from Eastern Anatolian Provinces of Turkey. MoCT has also submitted the publication on Mapping of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Kars Province in 81 provinces within Turkey explaining the methodology and cooperation with a University. Actually, it is possible to observe some universities organizing competitions concerning the intangible cultural heritage concept and values of their provinces.

The international Minstrels Festival continues to be held regularly every year with a broader participation. Minstrels Association holds regular activities within the Culture House. MoCT and Municipality of Kars keeps contributing for the organization of different activities for various occasions. The interest of women in Minstrelsy Tradition has been increased also through the training programme held on “saz” and “tar” making and performing. The atelier is still functioning. The master is keen on continuing the activity. A chorus has been established within the training programme. This chorus will be involved in the future cultural activities of the province. This initiative raised awareness among local communities about their intangible cultural assets of their province and stimulated the MoCT to consider the safeguarding of this tradition as a priority. The methodology used in supporting the Minstrelsy Tradition in means of; transmission in written form, creating platform for the making and performing traditional instruments, contribution to promotion providing a culture house formed a solid basis for further activities. For example, within the files concerning the precautions in order to safeguard the ICH prepared through MoCT, it is mentioned that the coffee houses dedicated to Minstrels shall be revived as they do not exist anymore. So, the importance of creating new environments for the viability of this tradition became important. That is why the establishment of a culture house and the modality of cooperation is a good example. An additional concrete example is the request of suggestions of the Municipality of Sivas from the Municipality of Kars for the same kind of implementation. The Minstrels in Kars Province are proud and satisfied to have a place to practice and transmit this tradition. They feel more responsible towards the young generation interested in this tradition and contribute to the viability of it.

The books and audiovisual materials produced on local intangible cultural heritage (Minstrels’ CD, book on traditional folk tales, research on ICH mapping) also filled a crucial in the promotion of Kars cultural assets, providing basic instruments for spreading a more positive and more informed knowledge on the richness and diversity of Kars’s heritage.

The awareness raising brochures were distributed to the museums, tourism information centers and all relevant places all over Turkey. The MoCT will reprint new copies to meet the needs of interested parts. The brochures are expected to bring concrete results in terms of enhanced knowledge on the concerned issues, and thus to strengthen the respect and safeguarding of cultural heritage.

As to the definition of the inventory of immovable cultural heritage in the target area complete with GIS and georadar data, photographic surveys and necessary measurements, assessment of conservation status served to establish sustainable mechanisms for the safeguarding and management of cultural heritage, to be autonomously operated by local stakeholders after the end of project. It will ensure an efficient and effective monitoring and the implementation of conservation, renovation, implementation, repair permit, building use permit, observation, inspection, licensing and project management activities in relation to the registered sites and assets. The creation of the automated system stimulated the MoCT to give priority to the establishment of Kars Preservation Council and the new assigned personnel benefited from this new initiative and attended all the training programmes.

In 2005 the new legislation concerning site management plan was entered into force but the implementation has not commenced yet. To this end, UNESCO’s guidance in this means ensured and facilitated the process within international standards and a model for site management is prepared to be put into practice. Draft action plan served to stimulate the need for the assignment of a new site manager and head of excavations to give official support and incentives to strengthen the management structures or other initiatives which may be pertinent for the process. As a result of the draft Management Plan the stakeholders are introduced to each other in order to cooperate, the roles



and responsibilities of the partners are defined. The local authorities increased their ownership and role in safeguarding and promoting the Ani Archeological Site. Most of the meetings and press conferences are held under the auspices of the Governorate of Kars. The site is under the management and control of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MoCT) which carries out and coordinates the excavation as well as the conservation works. MoCT has accelerated the restoration and preservation works in the area and consideration of Ani as priority become visible. Through MoCT's Cultural Assets and Museums Investment programmes, around 375.000 Euro (550.000 TL) have been allocated for restoration/preservation works at Ani in 2009, and 350.000 Euro (700.000 TL) in 2010.

Awareness raising on the importance of cultural heritage and cultural diversity also achieved by advocacy and visibility through strong relations with media. The workshops, training programmes, field researches and the publications produced as a result of these works are the basic tools for capacity development.

The project has a huge potential to sustainably contribute to the socio-cultural and economic development of the entire province through development of Kars as Brand City for cultural tourism, and generating related enterprises and micro-business development. It aimed at and already successfully ensured vertical linkage of the local communities, the provincial governorate/municipality, and the central government to facilitate more responsive, need-based and all inclusive strategy and programme development. The JP has given particular importance to the collaboration with the civil society and the private sector, in order to develop their capacities and collaboration with relevant authorities. The JP has established good practices and methodologies to be possibly shared and replicated elsewhere in Turkey or beyond, e.g., the preparation of the Ani Site Management Plan, the Children Museum Rooms, the Training Modules for technical/managerial skills for income generation and micro and small business development, etc. Acting on a demand-driven basis with the national implementing partner, the Joint Programme developed a very close cooperation with the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MoCT), benefiting on the one hand of the MoCT expertise and guidance, and contributing on the other to further develop MoCT's capacities in the concerned fields of action. Official relations with MoCT are coordinated through the Department of External Relations and EU Coordination of the Ministry, which ensures that the relevant General Directorates of the Ministry provide the necessary inputs and guidance to the JP's action. Although the JP partner Agencies work in a coordinated, complementary and mutually supportive manner, each UN Agency has its primary partner within the MoCT according to the respective competences and their relevance to the JP's action and outputs. In broad strokes, the UNESCO contributions to project objectives in promoting sound management of tangible cultural heritage (Outputs 1.1 and 1.2) and the safeguarding and promotion of intangible cultural heritage (Output 3.1) are linked to the mandates of the **General Directorate of Cultural Heritage and Museums**, and the **General Directorate of Research and Training** respectively. As for the financial resources provided in order to implement the activities, apart from the funds allocated by the UNJP, MoCT assisted the local authorities to raise additional funds through the Prime Ministry Promotion Fund, especially in order to contribute to the realization of the 5<sup>th</sup> International Minstrel Festival. Besides, the Municipality of Kars also provided additional funds for the rehabilitation of the Culture House coordinated by UNESCO. Finally, the Grant Scheme for local pilot projects coordinated by UNDP also ensured the co-financing of activities by the selected applicants. These are further sign of the local partners' ownership, commitment and cooperation. The programme successfully ensured vertical linkage of the local communities, civil society actors and private sector with the local authorities (provincial governorate, the municipality) and the central government, thus facilitating more responsive, need-based and inclusive strategy and programme development. It has both upstream dimension in terms of formulation of Tourism Development Strategy (based on culture, nature and winter sports) and Sustainable Tourism Development Action Plan and establishment of Tourism Development Organization as well as downstream income generating and poverty alleviation interventions with focus on women entrepreneurs. It ensures the proper and effective safeguarding of cultural heritage in the target area as a necessary condition for the development of a sustainable cultural tourism, also developing good practices to be possibly replicated in different areas of the beneficiary country. Generally, since the JP's inception the collaboration, participation and sense of ownership by the national and local partners greatly increased, as well as the JP's awareness and visibility. The Joint Programme form a

model for the Government to effectively implement two National Tourism Strategies (i.e. the 2023 Tourism Strategy and 2007-2013 Tourism Strategy and Action Plan) and it was also based on another existent national strategy, the Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013).

1. Expected output: A model for strategic direction, prioritization and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage and cultural tourism delivery in Turkey's less developed regions produced and implemented in Kars.

a) Performance indicator: Availability of a Tourism Strategy for Kars

Output achieved: Tourism Strategy Document for Kars is available and approved in a consultative process by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism and all partnering UN agencies (approval date: 22 December 2010). The report includes a Diagnostic Report which evaluates the potential of tourism development in Kars, a Master Plan with recommendations for the sustainable development of tourism in Kars based on culture, nature and winter sports tourism products, and, an Action Plan for the implementation of the Master Plan recommendations.

b) Performance indicator: Availability of tourism products strategically identified on the basis of supply and demand

Output achieved: A complete qualitative and quantitative audit of Kars Province tourism facilities and services was carried out. The tourism potential of cultural tourism assets (tangible and intangible) based on UNESCO's identification and evaluation was assessed. The institutional capacity assessment was carried out and the possible structure of a Tourism Governance Organization (TGO) elaborated. Market profile, trends and opportunities of tourism assessed. A survey of selected international and national tour operators on current and potential interest of Kars as a tourism destination was conducted. A tourism marketing and promotional strategy including a three-year Action Plan was prepared in May 2011. A proposal for the setting up of a Tourism Information Centre was included as an Annex to the report. A logo and slogan for Kars Province were created. Tourism products also developed through the grant scheme, including felt gift items by women, Kars knick-knacks and a literature route of Kars. Promotional brochures (general information, winter, nature and culture thematic brochures) for Kars Province were approved and officially presented in July 2011. A famtour was organized for international tour operators and national tourism stakeholders and media representatives. The content of a website was prepared and launched, and ToR for a potential local person to develop and maintain the website was formulated.

c) Performance indicator: Presence of a Tourism Governance Organization

Output achieved: An assessment of the institutional capacity to develop and manage tourism in Kars was carried out and the possible structure of a Tourism Governance Organization was elaborated. Furthermore, a three-day workshop was held in Kars in May 2010 including 26 local stakeholders with the collaboration of UNDP and UNESCO with the purpose, amongst others, of establishing the framework of a Tourism Governance Organization for Kars.

2. Expected output: Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation job creation in the culture based tourism.

a) Performance indicator: Number of jointly implemented tourism related local economic development activities in Kars.

Output achieved: Training in English language was implemented from February to April 2011 – 3 local trainers were trained and 39 trainees (from tourism and tourism-related establishments) were trained. Training for tourism entrepreneurship was implemented in May 2011. The training included one-on-one intensive sessions with 17 tourism and tourism-related entrepreneurs to review and analyse their business structure and provide guidelines for their improved business planning and management.

- b) Performance indicator: Number of Capacity building activities of local and national Stakeholders

Output achieved:

**Capacity development programs:** These programs targeted enterprises/their managers, tourism employees, (potential) women entrepreneurs, with a view to increase their capacities to benefit from the tourism potential

**Grant programme:** A support scheme called “local development initiatives for tourism development” was announced in July 2010 to support a number of initiatives in order to: (i) meet the immediate small scale infrastructure or organizational requirements for the development of tourism in Kars; (ii) enhance the cooperation among stakeholders and public private partnerships in the field of tourism in Kars; (iii) create awareness on the importance of tourism in the economic development of Kars; (iv) support collective actions between tourism institutions and stakeholders to enhance public-private partnerships; and (v) improve service capacities of local tourism institutions and stakeholders for culture, winter and nature tourism through product development and/or human resources development programmes.

Support scheme for tourism development activities (income generating activities and/or cluster development activities launched with 8 initiatives supported.

Local governance mechanisms supported for tourism service delivery and promotion: UNJP made a contractual agreement with Kars Tourism Infrastructure Union (KARTAB) to prepare promotional materials such as booklets/maps, documentary and fair participation.

3. Expected output: Capacities of local authorities and civil society in promoting social cohesion and dialogue through fostering of pluralism

- a) Performance indicator: Number of Awareness Raising Workshops on Cultural Heritage and social cohesion implemented in Kars

Output achieved: Activities were fully completed and all expected outcomes were achieved.

In particular:

The field research on ICH in Kars province was completed, as well as the training and awareness-raising meetings on the inventorying of ICH (based on UNESCO 2003 Convention requirements).

The 6<sup>th</sup> International Minstrels Festival was held between 24-26 June 2011, organised by the Municipality with the support of the UNJP, with exceptional participation of performers from Turkey and abroad (Kyrgyzstan, Georgia, Azerbaijan and Iran).

The Culture House was established and its premises refurbished and inaugurated to host the activities of the Minstrels Association. Minstrels Association started to hold regular activities (practice, performing, training, social activities) within the Culture House.

The Kars Minstrels Fest was organized in September by the Municipality, with the support of the UNJP. Regular Festive events were also held on the

occasion of Ramadan in August. MoCT allocated 6000 TL. for the realization of these events.

The “saz” and “tar” making and performing training courses were completed. The master continues to hold regular traditional music courses once a week and training classes on the production of traditional instruments, on its own initiative and with the active participation of the local community (both men and women).

b) Performance indicator: Availability of information on Main ICH Assets in the Target Area

Output achieved: Activities were fully completed and all expected outcomes were achieved.

In particular:

The results of the field research on ICH of Kars Province carried out by Kafkas University under the supervision of MoCT has been prepared as a publication and printed. This book will be distributed to all universities and provinces of Turkey.

Books on Minstrel tradition and traditional instruments have been purchased in order to enrich the Culture House’s Library and increase the interest of people and particularly young generation.

40 Minstrels folk tales collected and published as a two volume book including a voice recording CD. The books have been distributed to related libraries and interested institution/ associations.

c) Performance indicator: Establishment of Children Museums in Eastern Anatolia

Output achieved:

Children Museum Rooms in Kars on 17 January 2011 and Erzurum on 21 April 2011 established.

Training modules in Museum Education were developed, published and distributed by UNICEF through Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Ministry of National Education, Ministry of Family and Social Policies (former SHCEK) and the University of Ankara (UoA), whose staff informed that the modules are being downloaded by a number of primary school teachers in the country and that other people are showing interest. This activity is planned to be evaluated next year. The friendship train activity was conducted gaining significant media attention and the government is planning to replicate the idea in the near future with a boat trip in the Black Sea. Children’s Museum Rooms in Kars and Erzurum are operational and receiving visitors and peer trainings were delivered and extended to other cities beyond the programme. As a result of the JP the government is planning to open a children’s museum in Ankara.

**d. Who are and how have the primary beneficiaries/right holders been engaged in the joint programme implementation? Please disaggregate by relevant category as appropriate for your specific joint programme (e.g. gender, age, etc)**

<b>Beneficiary Type</b>	<b>Category of Beneficiary</b>	<b>Type of Service or Good Delivered</b>
Public	National Institutions	-Awareness raising through workshops -Supporting Cultural Event
Public	Local Institutions	-Awareness raising through workshops - Financing Cultural Projects - Provide Technical Support -Strengthening Cultural Infrastructure - Supporting Cultural Event - Promotion of National Culture
Municipality	Municipalities	-Awareness raising through workshops - Financing Cultural Projects - Provide Technical Support - Supporting Cultural Event - Promotion of National Culture
CSOs	Civil Society Organizations	-Creating socio-economic opportunities -Developing of Support Mechanism -Financing Cultural Projects - Supporting Cultural Event - Promotion of National Culture
Private Sector	SMEs	-Creating socio-economic opportunities - Developing of Support Mechanism - Financing Cultural Projects - Supporting Cultural Event
Academia/Public	Culture Professionals/Me n	- Awareness raising through workshops - Financing Cultural Projects -Generation of Studies - Promotion of National Culture
Village Citizens/Men/Wome n (Headman and his deputy)	Communities	-Awareness raising through workshops - Developing of Support Mechanism - Promotion of National Culture
Children	Local Institutions	-Awareness raising through workshops -Developing of Support Mechanism -Financing Cultural Projects - Generation of Studies -Promotion of National Culture -Provide Technical Support - Supporting Cultural Event -Training and Capacity Building

<b>Involvement in Tourism</b>	<b>Gender</b>	<b>Position</b>
Sarıkamış Kar Hotel	M	Personnel Chief
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Kitchen Chief
Kars Karabağ Hotel	M	Manager
Kars Karabağ Hotel	M	Front Office Staff
Toprak Hotel	M	F&B
Kars Sim-Er Hotel	M	Manager
Eylül Patiserie	M	F&B
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Café Chief
Sim-er Hotel	M	F&B
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Security Chief
TUREB (Turist Rehberleri Birliği - Federation of Turkish Tourist Guide Associations)	M	Tour Guide
Kafkas University	M	Hospitality and Travel Services Teacher
Kars-Sar-Tur A.Ş.	M	Mechanic Instruments Chief
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Restaurant Chief
	M	Student
Grand Ani Hotel	M	Sourcing Manager
Sarıkamış Teachershouse	M	Deputy Manager
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	F	Housekeeper
Çamkar Hotel	M	Restaurant Chief
Sarıkamış Municipality	M	Deputy Mayor
	M	Student
Sim-er Hotel	F	F&B
Grand Ani Hotel	F	Front Office
	M	Student
freelance	M	Guide
Ocakbaşı Restaurant	M	F&B
Grand Ani Hotel	M	Kitchen Chief
	M	Student
Sarıkamış Çamkar Hotel	M	Personnel Chief
Kar Hotel	F	Front Office
Sınır Tourism	M	Manager
	M	Student
Toprak Hotel	M	General Manager
Kafkas University	M	Lecturer
	F	Student
Cilavuz Association	M	Board Member

Kafkas University	F	Hospitality and Travel Services Teacher
Kars Karabağ Hotel	M	Housekeeping Chief
Grand Castle Hotel	M	Sourcing Manager
Ocakbaşı Restaurant	M	F&B
Ocakbaşı Restaurant	M	F&B
Ani Ocakbaşı Restaurant	M	Chief
Sarıkamış Governorship	M	District Governor
Kars Karabağ Hotel	M	Food Service Chief
	M	Student
Çamkar Hotel	M	Technical Manager
Kars Güngören Hotel	M	Manager
Çamkar Hotel	M	Housekeeping
Kars Municipality	F	Deputy Mayor
Sarıkamış Çamkar Hotel	M	Head Cook
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Accounting Chief
Kars Sim-Er Hotel	F	Staff
Sim-er Hotel	F	F&B
Active Women Entrepreneurs Association	F	President
Grand Castle Hotel	F	Housekeeper
	M	Student
Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism	F	Branch Director
Kar's Hotel/KARSOD	M	General Manager/President
Kızılay Hotel	F	Front Office
Sarıkamış Social Facilities	M	Manager
	M	Manager
Grand Castle Hotel	M	Manager
	M	Journalist
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Saloon Chief
Kar- Sar-Tur A.Ş.	M	Tourism Knowledge Teacher
SERHAT Development Agency - SERKA	M	Director of Planning Department
Çevre Association	M	Board
	M	Student
Grand Castle Hotel	M	Front Office Manager
Çamkar Hotel	M	General Manager
KARSOD	M	Coordinator
Boğatepe Life and Environment Association	M	
Kafkas University	M	Academic

Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Technical Chief
Daghdash Tourism	F	Ticketing
	M	Student
Boğatepe Life and Environment Association	M	Project Coordinator
Kafkas University	M	Instructor
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Sourcing Manager
Grand Castle Hotel	M	Deputy Manager
Ani Ocakbasi Hotel	M	Owner
Boğatepe Life and Environment Association	M	Cheese Producer
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Front Office Chief
Kafkas University	M	Lecturer
	F	Student
	F	Student
Grand Ani Hotel	M	Manager
Kızılay Hotel	M	Branch President
KAR-SAR-TUR A. Ş.	M	Manager
Kızılay Hotel	M	Manager
Kafkas University	M	Lecturer
Kars Sim-Er Hotel	M	Housekeeping Chief
Sim-er Hotel	F	Front Office
Daghdash Tourism	M	Manager
Kars Kazevi Restaurant	F	Owner
Kazevi Restaurant	F	Manager
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Captain
Kars Karabağ Hotel	M	
Kızılay Hotel	M	Front Office
Kızılay Hotel	M	Front Office
Grand Castle Hotel	M	Restaurant Chief
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	F &B Manager
	F	Student
	M	Student
Kafkas University	M	F & B Services Teacher
Kars Kazevi Restaurant	F	Food Service
Kafkas University	M	Deputy President
Turkish Airlines	M	Sales Manager
	M	Manager
Kars Hotel	M	Cook
Kars Women Entrepreneurs Association	F	President
Sarıkamış Çamkar Hotel	M	Front Office Manager
KARSOD	F	Tour Guide
Sarıkamış Çamkar Hotel	M	Sourcing Manager



Ocakbaşı Restaurant	M	F&B
Atatürk University - Erzurum	F	Admin Secretary
Press	M	Reporter
SME	M	Owner
Ce-Mar Toprak Hotel	M	Mountains Café Responsible
Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism	M	Deputy Provincial Director
SERHAT Development Agency - SERKA	M	Expert
Kars Culture and Art Association	M	President
Ocakbaşı Restaurant	M	F&B
Hotel Temel	M	Manager
Kars Karabağ Hotel	M	Front Office Staff
Kars Sim-Er Hotel	M	Head Cook
Kars Sim-Er Hotel	M	Food Service Chief
Grand Ani Hotel	M	Front Office Manager

**e. Describe and assess how the joint programme and its development partners have addressed issues of social, cultural, political and economic inequalities during the implementation phase of the programme:**

**a. To what extent and in which capacities have socially excluded populations been involved throughout this programme?**

Community capacities for cultural tourism created: JP has initiated a process of community articulation of the cultural sector around the touristic potentials of its cultural heritage. This means that a lot of effort has been devoted to build relationships between the private and cultural sectors at the local level. But also, and maybe most importantly, significant linkages and bridges have been created between local and national stakeholders. The JP contributed to strengthened capacities of the populations that are not traditionally included in the tourism sector, such as women. Women received entrepreneurship trainings as well as vocational training on tourism to be employed in the hotels, and other tourism facilities. Similarly, productive and income generating capacities of women were enhanced through the grant projects aiming at product development and increased market linkages. Two out of eight grant projects were directly managed by women's NGOs and women were the primary beneficiaries in at least two others.

**b. Has the programme contributed to increasing the decision making power of excluded groups vis-a-vis policies that affect their lives? Has there been an increase in dialogue and participation of these groups with local and national governments in relation to these policies?**

JP has made a significant contribution to raising the awareness of local and national stakeholders on the potential and value of Kars 'cultural heritage. This awareness and the capacities built are expected to be pillars to sustain the development of sustainable cultural tourism in the future.

The United Nations Joint Programme (UNJP) "Alliances for Culture Tourism in Eastern Anatolia" is framed within the Culture and Development thematic window of the MDG-Fund to contribute to poverty reduction through the mobilization of cultural heritage in the Kars province (with a population of 300,000). The aim of the programme was to safeguard tangible and intangible cultural heritage and develop capacities of communities and enterprises for income generation and job creation in the field of cultural tourism. Particular efforts were made to ensure full and equal

participation of women in the JP activities and benefits.

**c. Has the programme and its development partners strengthened the organization of citizen and civil society groups so that they are better placed to advocate for their rights? If so how? Please give concrete examples.**

UN Joint Program contributed to the realization of MDG-1 at a localized level by addressing Turkey's regional developmental disparities. In specific, the joint program designed to develop the cultural tourism sector in Kars contributing to social cohesion by recognizing pluralism and by reducing income disparities between the people of Kars and the rest of the country. Consequently, the joint programme aimed at contributing to the tourism development policies implemented within the framework of social (cohesion) integration policies (Country Program Outcome 2.1.2, UNDAF) by recognizing pluralism, dialogue of cultures and the establishment of a culture of peace in Eastern Anatolia and with peoples of neighboring countries. Therefore, it is difficult to mention a socially excluded population considering the design and target group of the project. It is given special care to reach and involve various civil societies in every phase of the initiatives regarding their interest in Kars Province as it was the pilot city. The NGO's area of interest varied from art, culture, women involved in culinary tradition, sustainable tourism, and tourism for disabled, associations of investors, hoteliers, restaurants etc. For example the Association of Hoteliers and Restaurants in Kars cooperated for the training programmes concerning the production and performance of traditional instruments in order to contribute to the safeguarding a value of their province. Through the implementation of one of the grant programme, a lady was supported to develop a business on goose breeding and marketing. In addition, another grant programme served to help to the villagers of Boğatepe to establish a cheese museum through the contribution and technical guidance provided by UNJP. The ICH research carried out by the Kafkas University allowed reaching 81 provinces in Kars which are also direct beneficiaries of the project. It can be considered as a proof that the partners are not limited to the central Kars but also environs and through the activities held within the neighbouring provinces the activities are spread into the region and reached beyond expectations. Gender equity was considered as a priority in all initiatives. Women were given special attention and support to take responsibility, to develop capacity and contribute to the programme. The children were involved within the project itself. Consequently, the importance is also given to the children to improve their capabilities and interest.

It is believed that the programme and partners strengthened the organization of citizen and civil society groups enabling them to better advocate for their rights; examples are listed below:

- Participants of the English Language Course decided to jointly apply for a loan with a bank for a tourism-related SME in Kars: it is planned to open a café and offer tours in the city center. This project is still under progress.

- One participant of the SME advisory service from Sarıkamış cooperated with a hotel manager in Sarıkamış. When the Development Agency brought experts to determine the routes for adventure tours in Sarıkamış, this cooperation presented local ownership. The participant will open his camping area in the summertime.

- An association was founded in Sarıkamış named Free Thought Association (Hür Düşünce Derneği). The founding members of the Association stated that the main goal of this NGO will be to realize sustainable tourism in Sarikamis throughout the year.

- Kars Women Entrepreneurs Association applied successfully for the funds provided by MoCT for a project on production of handmade dolls as tourist souvenirs.

- Active Women Entrepreneurs Association participated in a workshop in the Netherlands on production of local bread and cheese. They are planning to cooperate with Kars Municipality to own a small factory and shop to produce and sell local tastes to tourists. This activity is still being processed.

**d. To what extent has the programme (whether through local or national level interventions) contributed to improving the lives of socially excluded groups?**

JP addressed the culture and cultural tourism as the basis of development and social cohesion. JP has also allowed for the generation of a genuine and innovative interdisciplinary approach, linking policies to practice and contributing to bringing reliable answers to community-driven priorities. In order to foster socio-economic development and to promote social cohesion while contributing to the achievement of the MDGs, the JP has, on the whole, aimed to build strong institutions, empower civil society, and create pro-poor income-generating activities building on cultural assets. Within this framework, the cultural domains covered by the JP has included the main culture-based economic sectors, ranging from tangible and intangible heritage to performance and celebration, visual arts and crafts, books and press, media, design and tourism. Indeed, the JP has sought to **make use of the economic value of culture** with a view to impact on a range of economic sectors. Moreover, they have used cultural heritage, in all its forms, **to enhance dialogue and strengthen social cohesion**. To this end, the main objectives of the JP can be synthesized in the following categories:

- ✓ strengthening of institutional capacity
- ✓ promotion of the inter-cultural dialogue
- ✓ development of culture-based economic activities
- ✓ preservation and promotion of national heritage
- ✓ improvement of population's participation to cultural life
- ✓ development of cultural tourism

**f. Describe the extent of the contribution of the joint programme to the following categories of results:**

a. Paris Declaration Principles

- Leadership of national and local governmental institutions

The involvement of **public cultural institutions** has been highly coherent to the main objectives of the JP as it was an important pre-condition to build a strong institutional framework, and as it underlines the attention paid by the JP to strengthening institutions and paving the ground for enhancing policies and management of national and local cultural assets. The importance of this aspect relies on the premise that social and economic development requires strong institutions to be sustainable.

Associating **national and local authorities** in the different phases of the programme not only ensures internal coherence, but moreover obtains commitments for a multi-sectoral, concerted and coordinated long-term policy strategy. In order for culture to work for development, political will needs to be mobilized, including for example government policies at various levels; policies of cultural institutions; education policies; policies of the institutions of civil society and policies relating to cultural participation and consumption.

The JP is characterized by a highly participatory process followed throughout the JP life which constantly involved **6 public cultural institutions** (including 2 Ministries and 2 Universities), local and regional authorities (particularly of the Kars province), **30 representatives of the private sector** (tourism sector and sub-sectors such as restaurants, hotels, travel agencies etc.), **11 civil society** representatives (associations and NGOs), and **4 international partners** (strong synergy among activities implemented by UNWTO, UNESCO, UNICEF, UNDP).

Conscious of the importance of stakeholder ownership, numerous consultative meetings were held, and **synergies and networks were created** and initiatives were undertaken to build a common sense of purpose among key stakeholders of the JP, all of which greatly contributed

to enhance the ownership of national stakeholders. Similarly, the participatory methodology of the field research on intangible heritage undertaken in 80 villages, as well as the awareness-raising initiatives through local and national media, contributed to enhancing the ownership of the JP actions by the local population of the targeted area.

Beside this, the actions carried out to reinforce institutional capacities have paved the ground for future sustainability. A significant example of this has been the establishment of the Tourism Governance Organization, created by a public-private partnership which is important in terms of creating a permanent institution and its potential to build networks for future collaborations. The JP has indeed been able to generate new networks involving national authorities, international development agencies, civil society and local authorities. In this context, the Ministry of Culture and Tourism has represented an important link by collaborating with local authorities towards the realization of their activities and assisting them in raising funds. An agreement has also been established between the Minstrel Association, the Municipality of Kars and the Ministry of Culture and Tourism in order to define the roles and responsibilities of each partner.

The **strengthening of the institutional capacity** has been key in order to assist in creating an enabling environment for tourism development in the Kars province. The JP fostered increasing knowledge capacities of the tourism sector, as well as new management and action plans and a higher awareness of the cultural potentialities, all of which are indispensable preconditions for the improvement of policies and regulatory frameworks. In turn, the latter are fundamental in creating favourable preconditions which render private initiatives effective. The tourism strategy with 33 tourism products prepared for Kars provided a model for Turkey's less developed regions and official requests regarding the application of similar action in neighboring provinces have already been received.

- **Involvement of CSO and citizens**

The JP has also engaged **civil society, NGOs and civil associations**, operating at a local level, at each step of the JP life. This is crucial to guarantee both ownership and bottom-up development strategies as well as sustained actions. Indeed, these actors possess the necessary tools and knowledge to spread the JP's benefits across local population and groups.

JP has contributed towards **improving the managerial skills of tourism service providers, creating tools for heritage promotion, and providing cultural operators with training and courses which help towards preparing for international tourism**. For instance, the Grant Scheme launched by the JP and benefiting institutions from the civil society and the private sector such as Kars Hoteliers and Restaurants Association, Kars Goose Breeders Association, Kars Culture and Art Foundation, was identified by most stakeholders as an efficient action for its direct effect on income generation and therefore its direct potential to reduce poverty in Kars (MDG 1) as well as for its efforts to mainstream gender and to reach women entrepreneurs (MDG 3). For example, the traditional instrument ("saz" and "tar") making and performing training programme created great interest in the younger generation and will be pursued beyond the JP. Moreover, great attention has been paid to enhance the tourism sector by attracting new tourists and visitors thanks to a number of promotional and marketing products and initiatives.

Finally, more than one third of the total beneficiaries of the JP belong to the private sector. In particular, **1,150 persons employed in cultural industries and firms** have benefited from the JP, among which approximately 50% have been women. This has also had an indirect effect on their families, advantaging an approximate 5,300 additional persons. Moreover, given that the economy is a network of backward and forward linkages through the value-chain, the development of the tourism sector may indirectly benefit the population living and working in the center of Kars (around 5,000 persons). Looking ahead, the JP activities have set the ground for potentially new economic incentives to flourish alongside an increase in tourism and the

potential creation of new small and medium firms - such as hotels, restaurants, shops and so on.

- Alignment and harmonization

Joint implementation has led to a myriad of successes which bring to light the enormous importance that culture has for human, social and economic development at the national level. It is important to pinpoint the success factors which knit together a series of actions/activities illustrating the added value and complementarity of culture when undertaking development activities.

Workers of cultural firms and industries as well as artisans and tourism operators have been supported through trainings, conferences, documentation, and financial and economic opportunities. **New employment opportunities in cultural industries** have been created, human capital and population's skills have been potentiated, artisans and craftsmen have been supported and linked to national and international markets, civil associations have been financially and technically sustained and cultural institutions have been strengthened.

- Innovative elements in mutual accountability (justify why these elements are innovative)

JP has been linking the support of creative industries mainly in the cultural and tourism sectors, but also in the field of crafts, to the creation of new workplaces. In addition, results also indicate a facilitation and support of recruitment processes or an increase in the percentage of women employees. Also linked with MDG 1 achievements, is the different ways of raising awareness about various aspects considered to be important by the JP, such as for example the relationship between culture and development, the importance of the work undertaken by governments and the UN, the need to innovate and work in synergy across different sectors, the impact of culture and art on development, the relevance of certain ancient traditions and their safeguarding. These results apply to different levels: awareness-raising at the government level, social level, or as regards the cultural sector, artistic sector, traditional sectors and development cooperation sector. The JP also indicates that MDG 1-related achievements can be closely interlinked with issues of empowering various groups, namely of empowering civil society and in particular community leaders and artists, as well as strengthening public administration.

b. Delivering as One

- Role of Resident Coordinator Office and synergies with other MDG-F joint programmes
- Innovative elements in harmonization of procedures and managerial practices (justify why these elements are innovative)
- Joint United Nations formulation, planning and management

### III. GOOD PRACTICES AND LESSONS LEARNED

a. Report key lessons learned and good practices that would facilitate future joint programme design and implementation

The success stories identified as tangibly illustrate how JP has contributed to specific national needs and priorities, while at the same time being characterized by an added value for the region. Often highlighting its multifaceted contribution to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), these success stories illustrate the capacity of the JP to **trigger results** and to give birth to **perspectives** going far beyond the local and at times even national border, through combining organizational and managerial skills-building for national and local authorities, promoting intercultural dialogue,

addressing women, children and youth as priority target groups and consolidating the comparative advantage of the UN Organizations' expertise and intervention in the region. The success stories entail the promise of serving as an example and an inspiration to other stakeholders and interested parties.

In the framework of the JP, a success story has been defined as a set of actions that result in a desired outcome based on collectively supported values that can be replicated in different contexts. It aims not only to communicate and showcase specific elements of the JP but also serves as a tool to crystallize memory and transfer knowledge in order to better inform and improve future programmes on culture and development. Out of many other success stories some of them were chosen in order to highlight their activities.

### **Children Museum training modules and Children Museum rooms in Kars and Erzurum**

#### **Background:**

The Museum Training Programme was developed in cooperation with the Ankara University Education Faculty, the Prime Ministry Social Services and Child Protection Agency (SHÇEK), the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MoCT) and UNICEF, whose goal is to include children's perspectives in the UN Joint Programme (JP) process and contribute to the overall JP goals with children. Some children participating in the Museum Training Programme are also members of the Provincial Child Rights Committee and are training their friends in their own provinces as "peer trainers." The training programme aims to implement the special training module prepared during the museum training process. **It is the first "peer to peer museum module" in Turkey which gives the opportunity to have interactive training in the children museum rooms.**

The Children Museum Training Programme encourages children to use national and cultural assets, understand the importance of the concepts of peace and tolerance, to know that their use is a right, and develop awareness regarding that information through peer training in museums. In April 2011, a second Children's Museum Room opened in Erzurum.

Before this activity, most of the province did not have any children museum training and there were no children museum rooms in Eastern Anatolia.

Children Museum Training Modules could be used in other Provinces of Turkey and a methodology and the Children Museum Rooms will be the first models for the Eastern Anatolia Region.

#### **Process:**

Museum Trainings delivered in eight cities with the participation of more than 500 children and 100 adults. The "Child Museum Training Module" which will be used as a key document for upcoming museum training activities, has been prepared and tested. Two children museum rooms – the first in this region - were established in the Eastern Anatolia of Turkey a may be a module for other regions and cities. The direct beneficiaries are Children Rights Committees, Social Services and Child Protection Agency, Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Provincial Directorate of Social Services, Provincial Directorate of Education, Directorate of Museums.

#### **Objectives:**

- ❖ **Helping peers to advance their knowledge**, skills and values and to assimilate culture through social, cultural, educative, scientific, sportive and artistic activities.
- ❖ **Ensuring that peers develop as self-confident individuals** capable of thinking systematically and creatively, taking initiative, conducting work in a planned way and expressing feelings and sentiments in aesthetic forms.
- ❖ **Encouraging peers to think creative and critically** and to research by ensuring efficient utilization of tools and instruments, resources and time and to develop a taste for arts.
- ❖ Enhancing the aesthetic sensitivity of peers by providing them **opportunities to capitalize on their own experience and interact with their environment** during the activities.
- ❖ Whilst being spaces where historical assets are preserved and exhibited, museums are also **active learning centres** where visitors may have fun and obtain a variety of information while cruising.
- ❖ **Learning in a museum** includes to investigate and learn and to find responses to individuals' curiosities with the guidance of the trainer.

## **Outcomes:**

Museum training modules developed as a replicable model to the other provinces and regions of Turkey. They comprise a training content which can be adapted to every museum.

The project aimed to enable participants to acquire the following skills; training and learning in museums, leadership, respect for differences, communication and social skills, motivation, awareness training, training in human rights and the rights of the child, training in children's involvement, training in cultural heritage, training in cultural awareness, training in creative thinking, and tolerance training. A creative drama method was frequently used during the training and it was particularly effective in helping participants to learn while entertaining.

## **Support to the safeguarding and promotion of cultural diversity and cultural heritage, with a special focus on intangible cultural heritage and the diversity of cultural expressions**

### **Background**

The JP provided concrete contributions to the safeguarding and promotion of the Minstrelsy Tradition, inscribed in 2009 in UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. This was achieved through the realisation of a series of complementary activities. The methodology used to supporting the Minstrelsy Tradition for transmission through written form, creating a platform for the making and performing of traditional instruments, contributing to promotion, and providing a culture house, all formed a solid basis for further activities.

While 20% of the audience of this tradition is female, the Minstrelsy tradition is mostly practiced by men as it is an art associated with travelling, and very few women, not more than 5, are associated with the tradition. These women are mainly from Sivas, Çorum and Eskişehir and not from Kars. Through the JP, women from Kars will be both exposed to this tradition and also encouraged to learn and practice it. The most important component of this initiative was the establishment of the Culture House, and the memorandum of understanding signed for this purpose between the Municipality of Kars and the Minstrels Association which will ensure the continuity and sustainability of related activities beyond the end of the project. Along the same line, the JP supported the preparation and publishing of a book on Eastern Anatolian Folk Tales, which will allow to further promote and safeguard oral traditions as a distinctive feature of the local intangible cultural heritage.

### **Process**

The need to promote this tradition has been defined through research carried out by the Kafkas University and the experts of MoCT within JP. The definition of the tradition was also very important in order to ensure the interest of the local authorities and communities.

The JP allowed to: organise an international festival of minstrels with widespread participation and visibility; produce an audio CD of selected performances of local minstrels; launch training activities on the making and performance of traditional musical instruments, "saz" and "tar"; creating the conditions for the establishment of a Culture House in Kars, intended for the use of International Festival of Minstrels (120 Minstrels; 5 women Minstrel, and an audience of 5000 in Kars, Kağızman and Sarıkamış). These activities are successfully held thanks to the effective cooperation of the MoCT with the Municipality of Kars and the active involvement of the local Minstrel Association.

### **Outcomes**

This comprehensive approach to the safeguarding of the tradition and model to support local and national authorities, particularly for the elements inscribed in UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity are both a success story and a good practice. The modality of cooperation, namely the agreement between a Local Association and Municipality, and series of complementary activities can easily be replicated in other contexts and provinces of Turkey.

- ✓ A good cooperation model was established
- ✓ The ownership from local communities and authorities was ensured
- ✓ The overall experience may serve as a model for the establishment of other culture houses and the creation of platforms for different traditions in different contexts.
- ✓ The Municipality of Sivas and the Municipality of Kars have formulated requests for the same

kind of implementation.

### **Technical Assistance and support of the mapping of intangible culture in Kars and its environs**

**Background:** An awareness-raising workshop was held in Kars (Sarikamis) aimed at informing the relevant institutions and stakeholders from the Eastern Anatolian Provinces on the concept of intangible cultural heritage and the preparation of an inventory of this heritage under the coordination of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MoCT). The preparation of the national inventory of intangible cultural heritage is a long-term and dynamic process under the responsibility and authority of the MoCT. Therefore, the inception phase of this initiative was important in order to define an appropriate partner who would collaborate with the MoCT to carry out the work.

The stakeholders at the inception phase were the Culture and Tourism Offices of 13 Eastern Turkey provinces, NGO's and Kafkas University. However, during the implementation phase of the field research, Kafkas University was the main partner. Field research for the mapping of the ICH in the

province of Kars completed by Kafkas University, under the supervision of MoCT covered 83 villages; 50 students from Kafkas University (50% women, 50% men) were involved and trained. Approximately 7,000 pages of data transcriptions, 2,000 photographs, and 260 video recording were collected.

#### **Integrating intangible cultural heritage assets into sustainable programmes of tourism development:**

- ✓ Field research for the **mapping of the ICH** in the province of Kars completed by Kafkas University, under the supervision of MoCT, covered 83 villages;
- ✓ 50 students from Kafkas University (50% women, 50% men) involved and trained.
- ✓ Approximately 7000 pages of data transcriptions, 2000 photographs, 260 video recording collected.

**Process:** Bearing in mind that the preparation of the national inventory of intangible cultural heritage is a long-term and dynamic process under the responsibility and authority of the MoCT and considering the short time available for the implementation of the JP, it was decided that the JP activities related to Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) would consist in the identification and mapping of the main intangible cultural assets in the Kars province, to be prepared and implemented in cooperation with the MoCT, the University of Kafkas, and UNESCO. The research undertaken is being considered for publication and diffused to a large number of Universities in Turkey (141), cooperation with academia is also contemplated.

**Outcomes:** The completion of the field research on ICH of the Kars Province, with a view to completing the mapping of the local ICH in its diverse forms of expressions, will contribute to raise awareness on ICH as an integral part of the local cultural asset. Furthermore, the research will offer a necessary reference in the future for activities aiming at the safeguarding and viability of this heritage, as well as for its inclusion into sustainable and responsible programmes of tourism development.



## Grant Scheme Programme for Kars Tourism Initiatives

### **Background**

According to the progress of the activities and feedback from the local stakeholders UNDP in the scope of UNJP team formulated a grant scheme programme as “Local Economic Development Initiatives for Tourism Development (LDITD) in Kars”. The objective of the programme was “*to support small scale infrastructural and organizational efforts that will meet the immediate requirements for further development of the Tourism Industry in Kars for Culture, Winter and Nature Tourism*” Within this scope, eight projects were implemented under the support scheme for tourism development. The list of projects was as below:

- CRYSTAL SNOWPARK AT 2400 METERS ALTITUDE
- SUSTAINABLE KARS GOOSE PROJECT
- OUR ASSET IS NATURE, OUR HOME IS PENSION
- THE CHARM OF KARS ON 3 ROUTES
- INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY BUILDING OF KARSOD (KARS HOTELS AND RESTAURANT OWNERS ASSOCIATION)
- CHEESE MUSEUM
- FELT FROM PAST TO PRESENT
- KARS DOLLS AND KNICK KNACKS

The grant projects were instrumental in providing seed funding for potential initiatives targeting tourism development.

### Lessons Learnt:

- Timing should be well concerned and planned.
- National ownership and coordination, strong local participation and civic engagement are the key factors determining the achievement of the programme outcomes.
- Ownership of the local stakeholders and joint planning and strategy development with the participation of the local partners at all stages, including preparatory phase is critical.
- Developing a strong common communication strategy for JP should be achieved to ensure a consistent understanding about the JP particularly at the local level
- Questionnaires should be developed at various activities (e.g. training programs) to reassure monitoring and evaluation of the activities and their impacts;
- Media relations can be more developed and systematic;
- Be aware at an early stage: JP is designed and developed jointly and joint work takes time:
  - JP preparation/approval/programme starting **process is too long** that existing conditions may not exist when the implementation begins,
  - Ensure that JP’s priorities and aims are the **priorities of the beneficiaries**
  - More **interactions with national and local partners** during the preparation process can facilitate better implementation
  - **Duration of the project** is usually short at the designing phase. It should be **at least three years** or more depending upon the difficulty of subject
  - Ensure **clear annotation of budget** lines
- Be aware at an early stage there may be a need for the revision of project document
  - Receive **detailed information** in the programme document

- Problems in programme **design and content** may appear
- Check **initial indicators** to make available evaluation and monitoring

**b. Report on any innovative development approaches as a result of joint programme implementation**

Business Advisory Services conducted to M/SMEs in Kars Province on the basis of giving one-to-one direct practical advice. This methodology was chosen in order to adjust the advice to individual businesses and make it thereby highly efficient. Furthermore, when organizing capacity building related to quality standards, training had been undertaken by directly cooperating with the Ministry, in order to ensure that the taught quality standards are conform to national standards.

Museum training modules developed as a replicable model to the other provinces and regions of Turkey. They comprise a training content which can be adapted to every museum.

The Site Management Planning is a newly introduced subject for Turkey. The first legal arrangement has been introduced in 2004 and a regulation has been prepared and announced in 2005. An innovative methodology as the "Ani Site Management Plan Development Framework " is a result of a wide participatory approach and it will be prepared through its own team without a need for tender process. A first time experience for MoCT after the new legislative framework of 2005. The ownership from local communities and authorities confirmed. The overall experience may serve as a model for the establishment of management plans in different sites in Turkey leaded by MoCT without a need for a tender process.

Supporting the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage as a Pillar of Cultural Diversity, A first time experience and model for cooperation with MoCT and a local university for the mapping of the main Intangible Cultural Assets in a province. An innovative methodology for learning about the intangible heritage concept and at the same time contributing to the identification of the local IC assets involving the young generation. The overall experience may serve as a model for new researches carried out through Universities in cooperation with local and national authorities. The collected data will serve as a contribution to local and national inventories. Identification of the tradition to be supported and design training programmes defined. This initiative raised awareness among local communities about their intangible cultural assets of their province. MoCT to considered the safeguarding of this tradition as a priority. A basis for further activities created through the methodology used in supporting the Minstrelsy Tradition in means of; transmission in written form, creating platform for the making and performing traditional instruments, contribution to promotion, providing a culture house. This comprehensive approach to the safeguarding of the tradition and the model to support for local and national authorities particularly for the elements inscribed in the Representative List of the UNESCO Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity can be defined as a good practice. This modality of cooperation such as the agreement between a Local Association and Municipality, and series of complementary activities can easily be replicated in other contexts and provinces of Turkey.

**c. Indicate key constraints including delays (if any) during programme implementation**

**a. Internal to the joint programme**

The design of the JP detailed and changes happened during the inception phase. The team, under the leadership of UNDP, took the time from March/April 2009 to May 2009 to do a thorough review of the JP using the platform to engage all key stakeholders. Approval process of the Tourism Master Plan took longer than planned.

## **b. External to the joint programme**

Because of the reformulation of the JP the inception report was completed 5 months later in May 2009 (inception phase). The Mayor and the Governor of Kars who were involved during the conceptualization phase (from concept paper to signature of the document) changed before the JP got signed, therefore additional time was needed to ensure their involvement in the JP. A number of activities and strategies, as they were defined in the original project document, were too imprecise to be implemented and therefore needed to be reformulated. This was particularly acute in those activities implemented by UNWTO. Thirdly, some of those strategies were outdated until approval and commencement of the UNJP. For example, the Ani Site Management Plan envisaged in the original document the setting up of an advisory board that the MoCT had already established when the project was signed in November 2008.

## **c. Main mitigation actions implemented to overcome these constraints**

During the process of the redefinition of the components of the JP the ownership of national stakeholders increased significantly. The process involved countless and painful meetings and negotiations but as a whole, this inception period is regarded as highly valuable and beneficial for the Programme. The design improved significantly although the definition of the activities still remained largely imprecise.

The JP provided a number of frequent spaces which allows information flows among UN agencies. Frequent travels were scheduled from Ankara to Kars and vice versa. Also, the entire team met weekly in a telephone conference that is rated very well as a tool to share information. These communication mechanisms were instrumental in ensuring a smooth coordination between partner agencies, particularly considering that the activities were all interdependent.

## **d. Describe and assess how the monitoring and evaluation function has contributed to the:**

### **a. Improvement in programme management and the attainment of development results**

The coordination among the UN agencies in this Joint Programme was particularly challenging mainly due to the geographical spread of the main partners with two out of four UN implementing agencies as nonresident, one located in Venice and another in Madrid. Additionally, there was a site team naturally located in Kars that had to coordinate with the UN colleagues working in Ankara. Despite these challenges the coordination had been successful. In general, the coordination with government and other national stakeholders was very high. These are the key factors for this success.

### **b. Improvement in transparency and mutual accountability**

The JP is extraordinarily inclusive, for instance, the Programme Management Committee was composed of more than 30 stakeholders who met regularly. During the course of the evaluation it was apparent that the PMC was a valid place where a variety of stakeholder's voices were heard. The PMC had become a large and transparent melting pot. All members were treated with equal deference and respect. Apart from the PMC there are several other venues of exchange both in Ankara and in Kars. At the local level, the coordination meetings facilitated by the Programme were regarded by local authorities to have disciplined the coordination dynamics among the tourism sector.

### **c. Increasing national capacities and procedures in M&E and data**

The JP includes a high number of workshops and training programmes. During the course of the evaluation these programmes had M&E systems intended to measure the quality of the trainings.

The Study Tour to Spain was a valid means to create a common sense of purpose among key stakeholders of the JP particularly those from Kars. Most significantly, it contributed greatly to enhancing the ownership of national stakeholders.

**d. To what extent was the mid-term evaluation process useful to the joint programme?**

The mid-term evaluation was useful to determine what had been achieved during the implementation and how this progress related to the goals of the JP. It also aimed to generate substantive knowledge on the MDG-F thematic window of *Culture and Development* by identifying best practices and lessons learned that could be useful to other development interventions at national and international level. It also analysed the worth and merit of the Joint Programme's design and process of implementation. The mid-term evaluation focused on assessing the implementation status, measuring outputs, and estimating development results and potential impacts generated by the Joint Programme. Also based on the recommendation of the mid-term evaluation exit strategy and improvement plan was prepared for future.

**a. Describe and assess how the communication and advocacy functions have contributed to the:**

**a. Improve the sustainability of the joint programme**

At the beginning of the Joint Programme a communications strategy was developed. This strategy consisted visibility, awareness raising and advocacy dimensions. The Joint Programme saw the national and local ownership as the main assurance of the sustainability. Therefore communication activities were planned and implemented according to this point.

The national partner of the Joint Programme was the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MoCT). In order to maintain the national ownership all the communication activities or products either developed or implemented together or at least with coordination with the MoCT. The communication activities along with all the other activities of the Joint Programme, designed according to the national strategies developed by the MoCT.

On local level, local stakeholders (both in public and private sector) and local media have been informed regularly and /or included the implementation process. Also it was emphasized that the Joint Programme and its values actually theirs.

In all the printed, published, verbal material that were produced by the Joint Programme an informative paragraph was repeated (That was: The Joint Programme was designed according to the national strategies of Turkey and the MoCT is the national owner of the Joint Programme. And the sustainability of the Joint Programme would be built and maintained only with national and local ownership)

Some communication activities (such as the info tour for national media and tour operators) designed and implemented by local stakeholders. And they participated in some others, like the international tourism fairs in Istanbul (EMITT), Moscow (MITT) and Berlin (ITB).

**b. Improve the opportunities for scaling up or replication of the joint programme or any of its components**

Within the three years of implementation of the UN Joint Programme, various activities were realized under several headings: Training and Capacity Enhancement, Income Generation and Job Creation, Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage, Promotion, Strategy and Planning and Cultural Heritage and Tourism from the Children's Perspective.

Within the scope of Cultural Heritage and Tourism from the Children's Perspective component Joint Programme developed a museum training programme and a training kit that consist of 5 books. Moreover as a part of this component Turkey's first children's museum rooms were opened in Kars

and the neighbouring city Erzurum. MoCT. The museum training kit distributed to different schools and museum in Turkey by the MoCT. The children's museum rooms will be opened in other cities, Within the scope of Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage (tangible and intangible) component a set of brochure about the safeguarding of cultural assets were published and distributed to the museums in 81 provinces of Turkey by the Ministry.

Participation to the international tourism fairs broadened the vision of the locals and will continue in the upcoming years.

A set of four new tourism brochures were prepared and published in order to promote Kars' tourism potential and delivered to the MoCT.

The JP is currently scaled up with a new initiative developed between UNDP and the Ministry of Culture and Tourism aiming to develop the capacities of the MoCT and other relevant actors to plan and implement sustainable/community based tourism. This initiative is based on the experiences and lessons learned in this JP and the Eastern Anatolia Tourism Development Project implemented jointly with MoCT and UNDP. Such scaling up will focus on capacity building at enabling environment level (particularly for legislative framework and to better identify roles and responsibility of various Ministries) and institutional level (particularly for MoCT and relevant local actors engaged in tourism). The MoCT is also willing to replicate this JP in other parts of Turkey, and to develop new similar projects where they will engage in a similar structure.

### **c. Providing information to beneficiaries/right holders**

Programme Management Committee (PMC) meetings were held every three months during the course of the Joint Programme. In each PMC meeting all the participants (MoCT representatives, partnering UN Agencies, local stakeholders and public and private sector representatives) were informed about the communication activities of the Joint Programme. Moreover, press releases and bulletins were shared with the local media on a regular basis. Also Joint Programme web site regularly updated with the news, reports, publications, photos etc.

### **b. Please report on scalability of the joint programme and/or any of its components**

#### **a. To what extent has the joint programme assessed and systematized development results with the intention to use as evidence for replication or scaling up the joint programme or any of its components?**

The involvement of relevant Departments of MoCT as well as the relationship of MoCT with local actors has been assessed as very effective by the national counterparts.

#### **b. Describe example, if any, of replication or scaling up that are being undertaken**

The JP is currently scaled up with a new initiative developed between UNDP and the Ministry of Culture and Tourism aiming to develop the capacities of the MoCT and other relevant actors to plan and implement sustainable/community based tourism. This initiative is based on the experiences and lessons learned in this JP and the Eastern Anatolia Tourism Development Project implemented jointly with MoCT and UNDP. Such scaling up will focus on capacity building at enabling environment level (particularly for legislative framework and to better identify roles and responsibility of various Ministries) and institutional level (particularly for MoCT and relevant local actors engaged in tourism). The MoCT is also willing to replicate this JP in other parts of Turkey, and to develop new similar projects where they will engage in a similar structure.

#### **c. Describe the joint programme exit strategy and asses how it has improved the sustainability of the joint program**

Below is the Sustainability note prepared in the JP.

## Introduction

The JP primarily aims to **contribute to poverty reduction through building capacities leveraging cultural tourism and mobilization of cultural heritage in the Kars** province by safeguarding tangible and intangible cultural heritage and developing capacities of communities and enterprises for income generation and job creation in the field of tourism. The primary beneficiaries are the citizens and local authorities of Kars, who are/could be involved in cultural tourism activities or related sectors. In order to reach this aim the JP intended to create the conditions (tools and platform) for all stakeholders to develop local tourism in the mid-term.

In this JP, additional efforts have been made to ensure that women benefit equally from the activities. Women have been particularly encouraged and supported to undertake economic activities and create sustainable income generating activities gain economic benefits. The JP also aims to contribute to social cohesion by recognizing pluralism and cultural diversity, and by reducing income disparities between people of Kars and the rest of the country.

The programme is structured to enhance the capacities of national and local stakeholders for the safeguarding and management of tangible and intangible cultural heritage, as well as for the definition and implementation of a strategy to develop on tourism and related income generation activities.

This document is prepared to indicate the actions during the termination phase of the JP, as an exit strategy to sustain the JP's achievements, outcomes and results, as well as to verify the possible diffusion or scaling-up of the good practices developed during the programme. The proposed actions especially focus on the transfer of ownership from the JP partners to the stakeholders and beneficiaries, at both central and local levels (e.g. Ministry of Culture and Tourism, local authorities, private sector, SERKA Development Agency, etc.). The main objectives during this period shall be to ensure and/or contribute to:

- Sustainability of outcomes
- Sustainability of policies/strategies
- Institutional sustainability
- Sustainability of processes

The document also addresses the activities successfully carried out between period of 31 July 2011 and 31 December 2011 as well as the activities that will be carried out between 31 December 2011 and 31 March 2012.

The table below indicates the main features and potentials of each achievement, actions related to fortify the achievement towards ensuring their sustainability, main assumptions and risks which the sustainability of the achievements depends on. Sustainability of each action is being indicated whether it leads to sustaining the outcomes, and/or financial and institutional sustainability.

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Development of a model for the sustainable management of tangible cultural heritage, by means of the digitization of data on conservation, monitoring and supervision of registered sites and immovable cultural and natural assets in the province of Kars	<p>Software programme activated for the management of the digitized information, and training provided to build capacities of relevant users/authorities (MoCT, Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism in Kars and Erzurum, Kars Governorate, Kars Museum and other relevant institutions.)</p> <p>Hardware system and technical components to be installed at the Kars Preservation Council.</p> <p>The creation of the software and automated system for the creation of digital data on conservation, monitoring and supervision of cultural and natural assets in the province of Kars provides the relevant authorities with an effective tool for the effective management of cultural assets, which is a necessary condition for the development</p>	<p>Exit actions will focus on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- ensuring the effective installation of the procured hardware components</li> <li>- ensuring the activation of the system and its proper functioning</li> <li>- support the further development of the system users' capacities</li> </ul> <p>The ArcGIS system has been installed newly established Kars Preservation Council and further trainings completed</p> <p>Proper use and function will be followed by regular reporting to MoCT</p>	The system will ensure an efficient and effective monitoring and the implementation of conservation, renovation, implementation, repair permit, building use permit, observation, inspection, licensing and project management activities in relation to the registered sites and assets.	X		X	X	Completed

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Production of a set of 7 brochures for the promotion and awareness raising on the legislative and normative framework for the safeguarding of cultural heritage in Turkey.	The activity does not present special concerns in terms of sustainability; The tool is available and ready for use. So far, the brochures were distributed to the museums, tourism information centers and all relevant places all over Turkey. The graphic files and all materials for the reproduction of the brochures have been already transferred to the MoCT.	Additional copies reproduced by UNJP. The JP encouraged MoCT to continue with the dissemination of the brochures. The JP proposed MoCT to cooperate with Ministry of Education in order to use the brochures within the schools.	Brochures will be widely used in Turkey.	x	x			Completed



Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Ani Site Management Framework developed and approved by Ministry	<p>A road map towards the completion of the Ani management plan is ready, and the first draft Management Plan is about to be completed.</p> <p>A training programme has also been implemented to develop capacity of relevant stakeholders on the management of cultural heritage sites and the preparation of management plans. Participants from the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Regional Government and other relevant institutions benefited from the training, which included preparation of work-plans; delineation of roles and responsibilities; and modalities of cooperation in implementing the site management plan.</p> <p>The updated archaeological plan of Ani has been fully integrated in the new software</p>	<p>The JP continued to support the MoCT for the finalization of the Draft Management Plan and presentation to stakeholders to receive the contributions and comments for the final version to be officially approved. The JP assisted MoCT in completing the procedure for the official approval of the Plan, as a necessary prerequisite for its validity and future implementation. 5+5 years excavation programme will be prepared in 2012 by MoCT and coordinated with Ani Site Management Plan.</p>	<p>The head of Ani Site Management and Head of Excavation have to be appointed by MoCT, in order to ensure the approval of the draft site management plan.</p> <p>This activity represents a model/good practice to be possibly replicated at different sites in Turkey.</p> <p>The site is under the management and control of MoCT, which carries out and coordinates the excavation as well as the conservation works.</p> <p>Funds for this purpose have been so far allocated regularly each year.</p> <p>However, MoCT's institutional structure could be changed</p>	X	X	X	X	UNJP support completed, implementation of the Plan by the MoCT In Progress

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
<p>Tourism Strategy Document for Kars is available and approved by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism dated 22 December 2010. The report includes a Diagnostic Report which evaluates the potential of tourism development in Kars, a Master Plan with recommendations for the sustainable development of tourism in Kars based on culture, nature and winter sports tourism products, and, an Action Plan for the implementation of the Master Plan recommendations.</p>	<p>A complete qualitative and quantitative audit of Kars Province tourism facilities and services was carried out.</p> <p>Tourism potential of cultural tourism assets (tangible and intangible) based on UNESCO's identification and evaluation assessed.</p> <p>The institutional capacity assessment was carried out and the possible structure of a Tourism Governance Organization (TGO) elaborated.</p> <p>Market profile, trends and opportunities of tourism assessed. A survey of selected international and national tour operators on current and potential interest of Kars as a tourism destination was conducted.</p>	<p>1. Budget will be developed together with MoCT and SERKA Development Agency review funding sources etc.</p> <p>MoCT reserved funds for culture and winter tourism. Ani Site Environmental Plan, Ani Site Preservation Plan, restoration projects of monuments in the Ani Site, infrastructure projects for Sarıkamış Winter Resort was integrated into the investment plan.</p> <p>SERKA Development Agency has been launching grant programmes for the development of tourism in Kars.</p> <p>2. Four set of tourism brochures (General, Culture, Nature and Winter), provided to MOCT and Kars authorities to post on their websites.</p> <p>3. In</p>	<p>Legal Framework will not available for the establishment of TGO in short term.</p> <p>Change in the political and sectoral policies that may risk the validity of the Strategy in the future.</p>					<p>1. Completed</p> <p>2. Completed</p> <p>3. In Progress.</p>

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Promotion and Marketing Strategy	<p>Capacity building activities on promotion and information delivery with local stakeholders and governmental representatives were undertaken during the workshops held in the course of the study tour to Spain in December 2009.</p> <p>The elaboration of linkages of Kars to Eastern Anatolia and the identification further to the promotion of itineraries within Kars Province and surrounding areas, as well as an evaluation of enhanced use of and promotion of cultural events were assessed and included in the Tourism Master Plan for Kars Province.</p> <p>Awareness-raising training on cultural heritage and visit opportunities within the</p>	<p>1. A manual for the use of existing Tourist Information Centers in Kars Province prepared within the Tourism Master Plan.</p> <p>2. Promotional brochures for general information and thematic brochures on winter, culture and nature tourism printed and distributed by UNWTO and MoCT.</p> <p>3. In connection to 2. a web site will be developed in corporation with SERKA development Agency for the promotion of Kars as a tourism destination.</p>	Information center will be established.					<p>1. Completed.</p> <p>2. Completed.</p> <p>3. In Progress.</p>
				x		x	X	

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Capacity-building amongst local communities for entrepreneurship to enhance income from tourism-related activities.	<p>A training needs assessment (TNA) was carried out with the objective to establish a baseline assessment of capacity building needs for training programmes in Kars Province.</p> <p>Training programmes were designed based on the TNA including the identification of enterprise opportunities for identified communities and groups and particularly focused on potential enterprise delivery for tourism facilities and services in Kars Province.</p> <p>The following training was delivered, based on the TNA;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Training for tourism awareness-raising and a first set of training</li> </ul>	Trained local trainers will continue the training programmes.	Lack of interest to the training programmes.					Completed

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Tourism cluster roadmap prepared jointly with local stakeholders and pilot activities supported by the UNJP	<p>Internal networks mobilized through cluster development activities and partnership established. Potential for strengthened ownership at local level for sector development with increased capacities.</p> <p>SERKA's presence provides opportunity for local ownership and sustainability with regard to tourism cluster roadmap, since they are an agency mandated with supporting regional competitiveness/development</p>	<p>1. UNJP and SERKA (Development Agency) integrated certain elements of Cluster Road Map and Tourism Strategy in the work plans and strategies of the Agency.</p> <p>2. Knowledge and experience sharing with other provinces within the mandate of SERKA with a view to build a model that will be implemented in the future by the Agency.</p> <p>3. Roundtables will be organized with relevant national and local stakeholders for the sustainability of tourism clusters and prioritization of roadmap.</p> <p>4.A Community Based Tourism workshop with the participation of all relevant stakeholders, including the Development Agencies, municipalities, international governance organizations, tourism unions and</p>	<p>Assumption 1: SERKA's collaborative attitude will continue</p> <p>Assumption: SERKA's funding mechanisms are eligible for supporting tourism sector (tourism already in their strategy)</p> <p>Risk: Change in local positions upon the general elections</p> <p>Risk 2: Lack of willingness and ownership to lead the activities within the roadmap</p>	x	x	x	x	<p>1. Completed.</p> <p>2. In Progress</p> <p>3. In progress.</p> <p>4. In progress.</p>

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
<p>Capacities of communities and enterprises increased for income generation and job creation in culture based tourism. Three main line of actions to support this objective are as follows:</p> <p>1- <b>Capacity development programs</b> : These programs targeted enterprises/their managers, tourism employees, (potential) women entrepreneurs</p>	<p>Increased capacities of local stakeholders and outcomes of grant projects will be complementary to the Tourism Action plans to be implemented in Kars, through developed institutional and individual capacities.</p> <p>The fact that grantees were encouraged to partner with other local actors increased their culture of working together, which will be an asset in the future implementations.</p> <p>The fact that trainings were delivered by the MoCT increased the awareness of MoCT about Kars as well as strengthening local actors' relations with MoCT, creating a demand for the future, leading in the</p>	<p>Tools and methodologies will be transferred to SERKA, Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism and other relevant local stakeholders .</p> <p>KARTAB will be responsible for updating/reprinting the promotional material.</p>	<p>Assumption: The positive working environment created at the local level will be continued. (e.g. positive approach of local actors to work together)</p>					<p>In Progress</p>

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
<p>Activities for the safeguarding and promotion of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Kars and environs completed, (including: - field research and mapping (with, description and assessment of items; recommendations for safeguarding and transmission) - Awareness-raising actions on the UNESCO Convention for the safeguarding of ICH, and on the establishment of a national inventory.</p> <p>Establishment of the Culture House and collateral activities for the safeguarding of the Minstrelsy tradition</p>	<p>The mapping of the local ICH in its diverse forms of expressions is expected to raise awareness on ICH as an integral part of the local cultural assets, especially with regard to the heritage's bearers, and to reinforce their ownership. Furthermore, the research will offer a necessary reference for all future actions aimed at the safeguarding and viability of this heritage, as well as for its inclusion into sustainable and responsible programmes of tourism development.</p> <p>As regards actions in support of the national inventorying of ICH, it shall be noted that the inventory-making is considered as one of the necessary conditions to ensure the sustainable safeguarding of ICH and it is one of the priority actions that the signatory parties of the UNESCO</p>	<p>Concerning the completion of the national inventory, MoCT will follow the implementation through the receipt of better completed registration forms of the local ICH elements. Follow-up workshops may be carried out in Kars and other provinces of the Eastern Turkey. The distribution of the updated version of the booklet will be carried out by MoCT. The booklet will be updated every year and distributed to relevant stakeholders.</p> <p>MoCT will officially register the documentation into their Folklore Documentation and Information Center.</p> <p>As regards the ICH mapping prepared for publication and printed.</p> <p>Concerning the Minstrelsy tradition, follow up</p>	<p>National Inventory forms will be qualified and 2003 Convention of ICH implementation will be improved.</p>					Completed.

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Training course in crafts design and production conducted.	As a further element to ensure sustainability of activities enlisted in the previous row, training activities on the making and performance of traditional musical instruments, “saz” and “tar” were completed, with the participation of 20 students.	The JP will primarily aim at creating the conditions for the continuation of the courses after the JP’s end. A chorus has already been established. MoCT also registered the trainer Master (Mr. Salih Şahin) in the state archive as a resource person. He will be considered as a candidate for the UNESCO Living Human Treasure.	Interest to traditional instrument making and using will be increased.	x		x	x	Completed
A communication plan to ensure the visibility of the Joint Programme and the cultural/tourism potential of Kars was implemented.				x	x		x	Completed



Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Children Museum Rooms in Kars on 17 January 2011 and Erzurum on 21 April 2011 established.		In the Children's Museum Rooms in Kars and Erzurum children had museum training from their peers who participated museum training's of UNJP. They did also special workshops in order to learn more about Kars' cultural heritage and assets.	Children Museum Rooms in different regions in Turkey will be established.	x		x	x	Completed

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
<p>Children Museum Training Programme was developed in cooperation with the Ankara University Education Faculty, the Prime Ministry Social Services and Child Protection Agency and the Ministry of Culture and Tourism along with UNICEF aiming to include the child's perspective in the UN Joint Programme process and contribute to the overall goal with children. Children participating in the Museum Training Programme and who are also members of the Provincial Child Rights Committee are training their friends in their own provinces as "peer trainers." The goal is to implement the special training module prepared during the museum training process, in cooperation with the Ministry of</p>	<p>5 children museum training modules printed which could be replicable for other provinces and regions of Turkey.</p> <p>More than 500 children and 100 adult trained in these training programmes.</p> <p>The Children Museum Training Programme encourages children to use national and cultural assets, understand the importance of the concepts of peace and tolerance, to know that using them is a right, and develop awareness regarding that information through peer training in museums.</p>	<p>A network among the children established through the children rights committees and Social Services and Child Protection Agency.</p> <p>A cooperation agreement between MoCT and Ministry of National Education will be signed for the sustainability of the museum trainings.</p>	<p>Training programmes from peers to peers continued.</p>					<p>Completed.</p> <p>In Progress</p>
				X		X	X	

Achievement	Sustainability Tools and Potentials	Exit Action	Assumptions/Risks	Sustainability				Progress in Exit Action
				Outcomes	Policy / Strategy	Institutional	Processes	
Eight Child Rights Committees traveled on board of the "Tolerance, Harmony and Friendship Train" from Istanbul to Kars between 18-22 April 2011 with the participation of 33 children and 32 adults.	Two short films about the train journey and train diary book prepared for informative and inspirational for related future activities.	Social Services and Child Protection Agency will follow up both the children rights and awareness on cultural heritage.	Coordination among relevant institutions may be lower than expected.  MoCT and MONE will have a special agreement on replication of these activities in other provinces.	x				Completed.

#### IV. FINANCIAL STATUS OF THE JOINT PROGRAMME

- a. Provide a final financial status of the joint programme in the following categories (part only):

##### UNDP

1. Total Approved Budget: USD 1,682,040.00
2. Total Budget Transferred: USD 1,682,040.00
3. Total Budget Committed: USD 7,254.15.00
4. Total Budget Disbursed: USD 1,658,677. 78

##### UNWTO

1. Total Approved Budget: USD 601,340
2. Total Budget Transferred: USD 601,340
3. Total Budget Committed: USD 15,536.83
4. Total Budget Disbursed: USD 580,673.39

##### UNICEF

1. Total Approved Budget: USD 627.000
2. Total Budget Transferred: USD 627.000
3. Total Budget Committed: USD 9736
4. Total Budget Disbursed: USD 617.264

##### UNESCO

1. Total Approved Budget: USD 830 320

2. Total Budget Transferred: USD 830 320
3. Total Budget Committed: USD 16,503.02
4. Total Budget Disbursed: USD 813,157.89

**b. Explain any outstanding balance or variances with the original budget**

## V. OTHER COMMENTS AND/OR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

## VI. ANNEXES

1. List of all document/studies produced by the joint programme
2. List all communication products created by the joint programme
3. Minutes of the final review meeting of the Programme Management Committee and National Steering Committee
4. Final Evaluation Report
5. M&E framework with update final values of indicators

All above annexes can be reached from below link:

<http://www.undp.org.tr/Gozlem2.aspx?WebSayfaNo=1741>

### Project Documents

- [Official Project Document](#)
- [Project Inception Report](#)
- [Project Brochure](#)

### Press Releases/Speeches

- [Published press releases on project website](#)

### Related Link and Publications

- Kars Tourism Brochures
  1. [Culture](#)
  2. [Nature](#)
  3. [General](#)
  4. [Winter](#)
- [Ani Site Management Report](#) (Turkish)
- [Kars minstrels audio CD with MP3 streaming](#) (Turkish)
- [Folk tales from minstrels book and audio CD with MP3 streaming](#) (Turkish)
- [Museum Training Kit](#) (Turkish)
- [Brochures on cultural assets](#) (Turkish)
- [Mapping of intangible cultural heritage](#) (Turkish)

- [Friendship Training Book](#)

### **News and Press Clippings**

- [Sustainable tourism discussed in Ankara](#) - February 2012
- [Kars hosted international tour operators](#) - August 2011
- ["Friendship Train" from Istanbul to Kars](#) - May 2011
- [UNDP Administrator Helen Clark was in Kars](#) - April 2011
- [Museum room for Kars kids](#) - Feb 2011
- [Saving cultural heritage](#) - Oct 2010
- [Tourism potential of Kars](#) - July 2010
- [Minstrels in Kars](#) - June 2010
- [Children Friendly Museums](#) - May 2010
- [Warm welcome from Russia to Kars](#) - April 2010
- [Diversified menus](#) - Jan 2010
- [Strengthening tourism in Kars](#) - April 2009
- [Alliances in culture tourism in Eastern Anatolia](#) - Dec 2008

### **Project Website**

- [kultur.mdgf-tr.org](http://kultur.mdgf-tr.org)
- [visitkars.com](http://visitkars.com)